



TUDARCo **JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES AND EDUCATION**

A JOURNAL OF DAR ES SALAAM TUMAINI UNIVERSITY

ISSN 2820 - 266X Volume 3 No. 1 June 2024



TUDARCo JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES AND EDUCATION

Editorial Board

Prof. Akim Jasper Mturi <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Editor-in-Chief
Prof. Noluth Diko <i>Walter Sisulu University (South Africa)</i>	-	Member
Dr. Felistas Richard Mahonge <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Member
Dr. Norman Sempijja <i>Mohamed VI Polytechnic University (Morocco)</i>	-	Member
Dr. Julius Tunsaje Tweve <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Member
Dr. Deoscorous Bernard Ndoloi <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Member
Dr. Farida Kassim Katuli <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Member
Dr. Mushumbusi Adolf Kibogoya <i>Dar es Salaam Tumaini University</i>	-	Member
Dr. Evans Wema <i>University of Dar es Salaam</i>	-	Member

Address

Editor-in-Chief

TUDARCo Journal of Humanities and Education

P.O. Box 77588

Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Email: tudarcojournal@tudarco.ac.tz

TUDARCo JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES AND EDUCATION

VOLUME 3

NUMBER 1

JUNE 2024

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editorial	02
On the Frontline: Perspectives on Lesotho Gender and Development Policy in Combating Gender-Based Violence <i>Josphine Hapazari and Mammefane Letoane</i>	04
Establishing a Consensus – Based Meaning of ‘Universal Health Coverage’ and Report on its History and Practice <i>Godfrey Martin Mubyazi</i>	17
Hip-Hop Music, Youth and Mainstream Politics in Tanzania <i>Jasper Harry Sabuni</i>	32
Parliamentary Broadcasting in Tanzania: A Fallen Tree Without Sound <i>Samwilu Mwaffisi</i>	44
Assessment of the Effects of 360 – Degree Performance Appraisal on Employee’s Performance in Private Telecommunication Companies: A Case of Tigo Head Office in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania <i>Evaline Jackson Laizer and Lazaro Swai</i>	55

EDITORIAL

For some years we have been involved in the discussion about the deteriorating trend in the education sector in general, but also the poor research products by Tanzanian scholars. There is a strong correlation between the two – education and research – as quality research products are an outcome of a good education system. So the discussion on improving the education system has repercussions to researchers or rather the coordinators of research. Some researchers applauded the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology for allocating a lot of funds for authors who publish in selected high profile international journals. However, this decision is just a quick fix which cannot change the trend of research and the education system of the country. It targets few individuals who have capacity but are not motivated to that level, and only from selected disciplines.

The discussion on the deteriorating trend of education in Tanzania has taken a different pace recently when the Members of Parliament (MPs) discussed the budget of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, on 7 May 2024 (Mwananchi, 8 May 2024). It was clear from the discussion that MPs endorsed the fact that we are in the wrong trend unless we do something dramatic. Three days after the MPs debate, the President of the United Republic of Tanzania, Honorable Samia Suluhu Hassan gave a public speech that was reported with the heading *Tuna wahitimu mamilioni hawawezi kufanya kazi* (ITV News, 10 May 2024). Meaning we have millions of graduates who are not able to deliver. The president admitted that the source of the problem is poor setting of examinations and examination leakage. President Samia concurs with the then President of South Africa - Nelson Mandela. While responding to black South Africans in 1995 who wanted him (Mandela) to lower the levels of education so that they could fit in the system he said, “Destroying any nation does not require the use of atomic bombs or the use of long-range missiles. It only requires lowering the quality of education and allowing cheating in the examinations by students.”

This fact notwithstanding, we understand that cheating is not the only problem undermining Tanzania’s education system. One of my WhatsApp groups had a short discussion on the matter after listening to President Samia’s speech. Rodgers Mbaga citing Honest Ngowi (former Professor, Mzumbe University) had a philosophy of “garbage in garbage out”. He elaborated that students from primary and secondary levels are ill-prepared such that if universities become too strict, they will not get enough students because many students do not have the qualifications of joining a university. In support of Ngowi’s observation, Samwel Maghimbi (Professor, University of Dar es Salaam) had this to say: “The problem started with UPE (Universal Primary Education) which was a good idea implemented without having qualified recruits. Standard seven and twelve failures were being recruited in TTCs (Teachers Training Colleges). Some primary school leavers underwent crash-training and became teachers. TTCs became political schools and the pride of our old TTCs like Marangu, Mpwapwa, etc. went down. It is unquestionable that an unqualified teacher can never produce a good graduate. University teachers find it very hard to teach our form six graduates.”

My personal observation from various universities I have taught in Tanzania shows that the problem does not end with students. Many of the university academic staff cannot perform basic academic tasks assigned to their respective jobs and this also affects the quality of our graduates. Therefore, we need to go back to the drawing board and seriously look at how to revive the education system in

Tanzania because where we are heading the country will be destroyed. The following are few points to consider:

- i) Assess and restructure, if necessary, all levels of education in Tanzania, i.e. pre-primary, primary, secondary, high school, and university;
- ii) Evaluate the education policies and the accompanying programmes if they are still serving the intended purpose, if not, revise them accordingly;
- iii) Establish a monitoring and evaluation component in each policy / programme which will provide feedback on how we are fairing; and
- iv) There is a need for TCU to establish an *Academic Audit* section that will be responsible to check, periodically, if universities are doing what they are expected to do.

Professor Akim J. Mturi
Editor-in-Chief

On the Frontlines: Perspectives on Lesotho Gender and Development Policy in combating Gender-Based Violence

Josphine Hapazari¹ and Mammefane Letoane²

Abstract

Gender-Based Violence (GBV) remains a persistent social ill, hindering progress towards equality and well-being. Lesotho, like many countries, has implemented policies to combat GBV. This paper critically examines how the Lesotho government addresses GBV and it also investigates how the Lesotho government combats GBV on paper vs on the ground. Thus, the study explored how the government of Lesotho is combating GBV in theory and practice. This study employed a qualitative approach, combining desk review and studying Maseru district as a case study. Phenomenology research design was utilised. Qualitative data from interviews were analyzed thematically to identify key themes and discrepancies between policy and practice. Participants were asked questions on how the Ministry dealing with gender issues is combating GBV. Content analysis and thematic analysis were employed, using data from government documents. The study found that the Lesotho government does not utilise GBV mitigation strategies such as increased police visibility; monitoring of ex-prisoners; involvement of the education system through poems, drama and songs; use of ex-prisoners and people in authority in GBV awareness campaigns. The findings are envisaged to contribute to debates on GBV as well as gender issues. Research that examines GBV mitigation strategies, as well as gender and policy issues, is vital because it enables policymakers to craft policies based on empirical evidence.

Keywords: gender-based violence, gender policy, government, mitigation strategies, Lesotho

Introduction

Definitions of gender-based violence (GBV) abound. The International Labour Organisation's (ILO) (2019: p. 1) Violence and Harassment Convention 2019 defines GBV as "violence and harassment directed at persons because of their sex or gender, or affecting persons of a particular sex or gender disproportionately, including sexual harassment". Violence and harassment refer to a range of "unacceptable behaviours and practices, or threats thereof, whether a single occurrence or repeated, that aim at, result in, or are likely to result in physical, psychological, sexual or economic harm, including GBV and harassment" (ILO, 2019: p. 1). Thus, the ILO's Violence and Harassment Convention (2019) offers a predominantly comprehensive perspective on GBV. The United Nations Population Fund (2020b) defines GBV as an umbrella term for any harmful act that is perpetrated against a person's will and that is based on socially ascribed differences between males and females. Hence, GBV comprises acts that inflict physical, sexual or mental harm or suffering, threats of such acts, coercion, and other deprivations of liberty. Combining these three definitions, GBV entails sexual harassment, improper conduct, threats and acts of physical, psychological, sexual or economic harm. It is crucial to note that GBV entails harm since survivors and victims of GBV incur physical, psychological, sexual or economic harm. This study acknowledges that there are various forms of GBV and victims of GBV can be women, men, children, boys and girls. Perpetrators of GBV can either be males or females, with males perpetrating GBV more than women due to socio-

¹ Lecturer, National University of Lesotho, Lesotho

² Lecturer, University of Pretoria, South Africa

economic issues inclusive of unemployment, gender inequalities, masculinity, patriarchal attitudes and gender stereotypes. The study focused on sexual violence as a form of GBV, with women as victims of GBV.

GBV is a perpetual social problem globally. The UNDP (2016) reveals that GBV continues to occur in Lesotho, and almost 86% of Basotho women experience it. With such extremely high GBV rates, it seems this scourge is likely to take a very long time and requires a huge shift in societal behaviour before it is curtailed to non-alarming levels. Furthermore, a study conducted by Gender Links in Lesotho, found that 40% of the women reported physical sexual IPV (Intimate Partner Violence), 30% reported economic IPV and 24% reported sexual IPV, with men being the perpetrators (Gender Links, 2016). Rape is so prevalent that in some instances, female learners are raped by male fellow learners. All these cases indicate that GBV continues unabated in Lesotho. Kabi (2018) also observes that domestic violence (DV) and GBV remain widespread in Lesotho and these two scourges undermine women's ability to take action.

The increase in GBV cases is not only noted by researchers and civic organisations, but also government officials take a keen interest in the GBV space. The alarming rise in GBV cases in Lesotho has captured the attention of researchers, NGOs, and the government. A 2020 report by Lesotho's Ministry of Gender confirms a surge in GBV during the Covid-19 lockdown, highlighting the urgency of addressing this issue (Koeshe, 2020). Sexual violence against women is driven by regional masculinities (Hapazari, 2023). Similarly, Mabale (2020) points to an increased number of GBV cases in Lesotho. All these cases point to increased GBV prevalence in Maseru district. Thus, literature shows that GBV continues to take place despite existing treaties, policies and strategies in Lesotho.

This study delves deeper than previous research that primarily examined existing mitigation strategies. It explores the experiences of GBV survivors in Maseru to understand the effectiveness of current interventions and identify potential gaps. By incorporating the perspectives of survivors, the study aims to identify areas where policies and practices can be better aligned to create a safer environment for women and girls in Lesotho. The current study explores how the government of Lesotho is combating GBV in theory and practice to find ways to improve the methods of combating GBV.

Theoretical Perspective on Violence Against Women

The paper adopts Heise's (1998) Ecological model of violence against women. Violence against women is one of the forms of GBV. Heine's model of VAW is relevant for this study of strategies utilised by the Lesotho government to combat VAW. The model's multi-level approach helps analyze the effectiveness of interventions targeting various levels. Even though the VAW model operates at four levels, this study focuses on the fourth level of the model, which is the macro level. The Lesotho government operates at the macro level and that is where the study's analysis will place its focus. This ecological model of VAW, as propounded by Heise (1998), underscores that VAW is caused by factors found at the four levels: the ontogenic, micro, exo and macro. Heise (1998) highlights the ontogenic level representing the individual history factors that each person imposes on his or her behaviour and relationships. This includes having witnessed marital violence as a child, being abused as a child, and having an absent and rejecting father. The second level of the VAW ecological model is referred to as the micro level. Fergus (2012) calls it the relationship level, adding that one of the worst risk factors for violence is male control concerning economic and social decision-making. The exolevel, also called the community level, is the third level of the Ecological model of VAW. Fergus

(2012) cites the following features of this level: seclusion of women from support mechanisms; and the lack of safe spaces for women and girls to freely interrelate and develop friendships and social networks. The fourth level of the ecological model is known as the macro level. Fergus (2012) points out that the contributing factors at the societal level include limited economic opportunities for women, and women's insecure access to and control over property and land rights. This model guided the researcher in crafting appropriate questions to pose to government officials regarding GBV strategies. The study examined VAW combating strategies such as policy pronouncements, ministerial initiatives and legal support services. The study examined GBV strategies that are applicable at the macro level, through the lens of the ecological model.

International efforts to combat GBV

The paper explores the GBV mitigation strategies suggested by various researchers, institutions, NGOs and governments (UN, 2003). Following the funnel approach of reviewing the literature, the international treaties are examined first, followed by regional treaties and the national policies to combat GBV in various countries are examined last.

Existing efforts at the international level include the adoption of the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (DEVAW) by the United Nations, which was ratified by Lesotho in 1995. Lesotho is also commended for ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, on 24 September 2003 (UN, 2003). Although the government of Lesotho endorsed both the UN Convention and its Optional Protocol, the UN committee raised a concern regarding the fact that the judiciary as well as law enforcement officials displayed a lack of awareness of these protocols (UN, 2003). The UN (2003) was also apprehensive that women residing in remote areas of Lesotho were not acquainted with the rights that are pronounced by the Convention as well as the Optional Protocol. The shortcoming of the citizens' lack of knowledge of the proclamations of such treaties is their inability to claim their rights based on those treaties.

Article 1 of the UN Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights defines terms utilised in crafting the Protocol (UN, 2003). This is commendable because it ensures easier comprehension of the protocol by different readers. Article 2 dwells on the elimination of discrimination against women while Article 3 emphasises the right to dignity, which is also stressed by the WHO (2020). Article 4 is about the rights to life, integrity and security of an individual while Article 5 hammers on the elimination of harmful practices. Konyana, (2016) highlights that Zimbabwe is one of the countries that has made strides in countries that have successfully addressed cultural practices through legislation, education, or community engagement. The cultural practice of honouring avenging spirits with female relatives cited by Konyana (2016) is one such practice. Article 6 underlines the rights that women are entitled to in marriage, Article 7 stipulates issues to do with separation, divorce and annulment of marriage. Article 8 clarifies how women should access justice and equal protection before the law, issues which Davies and True (2017) found lacking in post-colonial Sri Lanka. This protocol needs to be availed to vulnerable women so that they get this vital information to enhance their security as emphasised by Oche et al. (2020). Lesotho ratified the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa and the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, which are initiatives specifically designed to assist GBV survivors in the region (African Union, 2003; SADC, 2008). Article 9 stresses the right to participate in the political and decision-making process; Article 10 stipulates the right to peace and Article 11 highlights the protection of women in armed conflicts as emphasised by Davies and

True (2017). The current study lauds these articles, given that; all women deserve peace and security.

Various scholars have deliberated on GBV strategies employed by different countries. For instance, Jewkes et al. (2019) report that in Rwanda, the Indashyikirwa intervention reduced men's perpetration of IPV by 55%. The intervention involved changing community attitudes, norms and behaviours regarding GBV, thereby channelling people towards gender inequality. In South Africa, the Sonke Change trial was implemented in a huge informal settlement in Johannesburg; it also targeted to change social norms; and it was more effective on less violent men and less effective on the more violent ones (Jewkes et al., 2019). The current study subscribes to the notion of employing a variety of GBV mitigation strategies since the effectiveness of any individual strategy depends on the specific circumstances and personalities involved. Stakeholders ought to choose interventions that are best suited to their specific situation.

Norm-based GBV mitigation strategies are usually not sufficient, given that social norms are not the only GBV drivers; hence there is a need to incorporate other GBV reduction strategies to realise significant changes within communities (Jewkes et al., 2019). More violent men tend to normalise violence in societies, where GBV is generally understood to be a normal occurrence. As a result, women continue to endure abuse at the hands of men. Social norms such as protecting family honour, injunctive social norms, the husband's right to use violence (Perrin et al., 2019), use of drugs and weapon carrying (de Wet, 2007) are prevalent in Somalia, South Sudan and Lesotho because these norms are normalised and engrained within these societies. A study conducted in Lesotho found that normalisation of rape is a form of Gender-Based Violence in this country (Lester & Pandey, 2023).

Research has constantly shown the role played by masculinity in the commission of GBV (Graaff, 2017; Vonarx, 2014; Katz, 2006). Consequently, some of the GBV mitigation strategies are aimed at addressing masculinity issues. Graaff (2017) conducted a study in South Africa with the focal point being masculinity-focused interventions. That study aimed to find ways to improve the effectiveness of the interventions as a GBV reduction strategy. The study established that the most effective interventions were those involving supportive peer groups and role models since participants strived to become role models too. Graaff (2017) makes suggestions for the improvement of the interventions, citing that advocacy and policy development need to become larger facets of GBV prevention efforts. The study conducted by Graaff (2017) was around GBV and its focus was on interventions related to masculinities, whereas the current study took a narrow perspective by placing a focus on GBV mitigation strategies.

In a study on VAW issues in Nigeria, Dim (2017) recommended the following VAW mitigation strategies: the creation of enlightenment programmes for use in rural areas emphasising innovative and efficient media, GBV mitigation strategies using NGO websites, and providing GBV materials online so that all rural women can access these interventions. Using online materials in rural areas is problematic since most rural areas are characterised by a lack of knowledge on technology issues, lack of internet connectivity and unavailability of money to ensure connectivity. It should be added that for these measures to be successful, the internet ought to be available in those rural areas and ensure that the internet is affordable and accessible to rural women. If the internet is too expensive, another alternative is the use of community radios, where GBV issues are discussed, as similarly suggested by Barlose (2015). NGOs can assist by issuing these radios to women in rural communities. The radios could be those that use solar power so that rural women may not have challenges securing batteries since most African rural areas still encounter challenges concerning access to electricity. This study therefore addressed the following overarching research question:

How is the Lesotho government combating GBV on paper and on the ground? The study answered the following specific research questions:

- 1) How does the Lesotho government combat GBV, as spelt out in the Lesotho Gender and Development policy?
- 2) How does the Lesotho government combat GBV on the ground, as perceived by Basotho?
- 3) What are the discrepancies between the Lesotho government's Gender and Development Policy?

Methodology

This study employed a phenomenology qualitative research design, case study and desk research. Pathak (2017) underscores that phenomenological research design seeks to grasp the perceptions, perspectives and individual experiences of the participants under study. Since phenomenology focuses on lived experiences, we asked participants about specific GBV cases that they handled or encountered, and how these experiences shaped their understanding of government strategies. The sample comprised ten chiefs, ten police officers and five government officials. Chiefs and police officers were found to be ideal participants because they deal with GBV cases. Hence they were conversant with GBV strategies utilised by the government within their communities and police stations, respectively. The rationale of the sample size for this study was based on data saturation where we noticed that there was no further data collection needed. We observed that there was data saturation when new participants were now echoing previous participants in their responses. The sample size was also determined by inductive thematic saturation. Inductive thematic saturation is whereby researchers observe that the collection of more data does not lead to the emergence of new themes. Government officials are responsible for crafting GBV policies and mitigation strategies as well as implementing them. Before data collection, research permission was sought from the principal secretary of the Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation. Research permission was granted, and the researcher first conducted a pilot study at the same ministry using a smaller sample of officials who were not in the actual or main sample of the study. The pilot assisted in rectifying the structure of the interview guide and the phrasing of some of the questions. Interview guides were utilised as data collection instruments. Chiefs and police officers were asked about what the Ministry is doing to fight GBV within communities. Content analysis and thematic analysis were employed for secondary and primary data respectively. During thematic data analysis, we utilised an inductive approach whereby we first collected data that is relevant to the strategies to combat GBV and later looked for patterns emerging from the data.

Findings and analysis

There are various GBV mitigation strategies subscribed to by the Lesotho government. These are discussed below.

Lesotho Government GBV mitigation strategies

The findings address the key research objective of GBV mitigation strategies the Lesotho government utilizes to combat GBV. This study problematised GBV perpetrated against victims, particularly women by men. Mitigation strategies refer to plans and actions aimed at curbing a particular problem (Harvey, 2020). The section explores the GBV mitigation strategies that are being implemented by the Lesotho government nationally. One of the objectives of the Lesotho government's gender policy is to facilitate equal, legal and constitutional protection of different groups of women (GOL, 2018). Data from the Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation were provided by the Department of Gender, Social Empowerment Division through their Principal Gender officer. The aim was to compare information from government documents with the current

research study regarding GBV mitigation strategies observed by chiefs and police officers on the ground.

Creswell and Creswell (2018) recommend the use of data gathered from documents for qualitative studies. The intention was to be able to demonstrate the discrepancies between what is on paper and what is on the ground to improve practice. It is imperative that the Lesotho government actively champions the combating of GBV in the country and be seen to be implementing its policies and strategies. This is crucial since the government must protect all groups of women as articulated by the first objective of the gender and development policy (GOL, 2018). Several legislations, policies and practices have been enacted by the Lesotho government as a way of protecting women and girls. These include the Lesotho Constitution (GOL 2001), Sexual Offences 2003, Legal Capacity of Married Persons Act 2006, Anti Trafficking in Persons Act 2011, the Penal Code 2010, Standard Operating Procedures of 2003, and the Gender and Development Policy of 2018. Some of these will be explored below.

Lesotho Constitution

The term constitution refers to “a set of rules, which governs a nation-state” (Sinant, 2021: p. 2441). Some of the pronouncements from the Lesotho Constitution help to address one of the key research objectives for this study, which is, GBV mitigation strategies employed by the Lesotho government to combat GBV. The current Constitution of Lesotho was adopted in 1993 and was amended in 1996, 1997, 1998 and lastly in 2001. It is worth noting that the Lesotho constitution has been undergoing review, and is currently at an impasse due to political tensions around it.

Furthermore, the constitution is a legal framework and fundament for constructing, developing and running the state and its legal structure (Barnett, 2016). Chapter 11, section 18 of the Constitution of the Government of Lesotho forbids discrimination of any manner as well as any form of unfair treatment (GOL, 2001). Although the Lesotho Constitution does not explicitly underscore discrimination against women, Mabale (2020) observed that women are always victims of discrimination in the formal and informal sectors and within households. In addition, a very perturbing issue, about the constitution of the Government of Lesotho (GOL) is that it is very patriarchal as evidenced by various exemptions to the rule of non-discrimination, in matters relating to marriage, divorce, death, burial, transference of property, adoption as well as in matters in which customary law is applicable along with issues in the realm of personal law (GOL, 2001). It is recommended that the constitution of Lesotho ought to be amended so that it incorporates gender equality as well as sexual abuse issues.

The 2003 Sexual Offences Act

The government of Lesotho enacted the Sexual Offences Act, which *inter alia*, criminalises marital rape and provides for compulsory HIV testing of perpetrators (GOL, 2003). The enactment of this Act is highly commendable since it equips the courts with powers to decisively deal with GBV perpetrators. For instance, the Sexual Offences Act imposes a life sentence on perpetrators who commit sexual offences that put their victims at risk of HIV infection, knowing their HIV positive status: “where the person was aware of his HIV test status, had knowledge or realistic suspicion of the infection, will be sentenced to the death penalty” (GOL, 2003, p. 255). This shows Lesotho’s full commitment, not only to fighting GBV but also HIV and AIDS pandemic. Prior studies demonstrated that there is a link between HIV and sexual violence (Chitando and Chirongoma, 2012; Moyo, 2005). Some Police Officers explained that some villagers, mostly women are infected with HIV by their

husbands, hence this Act comes in handy regarding the prosecution and sentencing of such perpetrators. Most participants reported that they are not satisfied with most of the prison sentences for rapists. The Lesotho government further enacted the Penal Code (GOL, 2010), which regulates all assault cases inclusive of domestic violence. This is a step in the right direction, given that, laws offer protection to citizens (GOL, 2018). In March 2024, the Lesotho government passed the Administration of Estates and Inheritance Bill of 2024, which is a crucial framework in the fight against GBV since GBV is caused by a lack of empowerment.

The Gender and Development Policy

The government of Lesotho, through the Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation, also uses the Gender and Development (GAD) Policy as a guiding tool in fighting GBV (GOL, 2018). There are two versions of GAD policy and this study utilised the 2018 version. A policy is a set of guidelines, which emanate from management objectives that provide directions to attain organisational goals. Most governments, the world over, are guided by economic and social policies to solve various social problems (Latham, 2016). According to Reisman (2019, p. 23) “given that, social policies are action-oriented and problem-oriented, no policy fails to embrace values, ideologies and images of what constitutes a good and desirable society”. Notably, GBV cuts across the GAD Policy’s twelve priority areas, revealing the extent to which the Lesotho government is determined to prevent and reduce GBV. The policy also promotes economic empowerment for women and social awareness campaigns. However, participants highlighted that they do not witness any economic empowerment for women and social awareness campaigns within their communities. Police Officer Four highlighted this: “If you can move around our community, you will not see any projects going on. We need to see such projects for women to be empowered. The government is lacking in that area.” The GAD also confirms that more advocacy will go a long way in shaping people’s attitudes and values (GOL, 2018, p. 45).

Section 4.2.4 of the (GAD) Policy spells out the strategic actions the Ministry utilises to combat GBV; inclusive of SVAW, which is also a form of GBV. Under Section 4.2.4 the policy articulates a total of nine courses of action to be undertaken by the Ministry. One of the strategic actions is advocating for affirmative action through changing laws (GOL, 2018). On the ground, the results suggest that laws are not being changed as articulated on paper. For instance, laws Chief Three alluded to the following: “Another way to fight GBV is for the government to change laws. Our government is relying on the regarding sexual offence, which was passed in 2003 and has never been changed or reviewed.” The notion of advocating for better laws corroborates this research study’s findings and existing literature (Oche et al., 2020). At the core of the policy, is the need to ensure gender equality, and this study holds that such efforts can be realised by modification of social norms, attitudes and practices that contribute to the perpetuation of GBV incidents. This resonates with a recommendation by Jewkes et al. (2019) regarding changing community social norms. Change of norms is a long process, which needs commitment from all structures of the society, families, communities, churches, and traditional structures. Concerning the prevention of GBV, the policy highlights the need to strengthen multi-stakeholder collaboration and coordination (GOL, 2018). The UNFPA (2020a) also calls for concerted efforts among government, NGOs and CSOs. This is vital since the fight against GBV requires a concerted effort from all stakeholders. The South African Gender Policy, the Joint Monitoring Committee on the Quality of Life and Status of Women, was established to ensure that all legislation that is passed by parliament is engendered. The Lesotho government ought to consider incorporating such a committee to ensure the smooth implementation of GBV combating strategies.

Standard Operating Procedures

The Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation also has a document called the Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for prevention and response to GBV in Lesotho (GOL, 2018). The document clearly describes procedures, roles and responsibilities for each of the sectors involved in the prevention and response to GBV. Governments have the responsibility to give guidance to all ministries and departments (Barnett, 2016). *Inter alia*, the SOPs spell out the guiding principles for all actions and guidelines for working with individual survivors or victims. Latham (2016) emphasises that mitigation strategies that target survivors help to restore dignity and psychological well-being. SOPs offer guidelines to community members, health and education sectors. This study perceives the document as critical for fighting GBV since it targets different levels, as suggested by Heise (1998). The document also targets different sectors; thus, this study holds that such a document needs to be widely distributed to the public since it spells out the responsibilities of different stakeholders in the fight against GBV. The UN (2020) stresses that a sufficiently informed public can demand any anticipated services from the assigned sectors, if not availed as articulated in the SOPs. Based on some of the participants' narratives in this study, there are some gaps between what is prescribed by the GAD Policy and SOPs documents and the kind and quality of service offered by some of the key role players specified in the document.

GBV mitigation strategies on paper versus the ones on the ground

This sub-section presents findings on GBV mitigation strategies that chiefs observe being implanted within their communities and uncovers discrepancies between national GBV and VAW mitigation strategies on paper and GBV mitigation strategies being implemented on the ground.

Gaps can only be identified by scrutinising the discrepancies between the Lesotho government's officially proclaimed GBV mitigation strategies and the GBV mitigation strategies being implemented by the Lesotho government. This study triangulated by employing a desk review and conducting an empirical study to identify these discrepancies. Barlose (2015) notes that empirical research reveals that in most scenarios, the situation on the ground is lacking and ought to be improved. This is a crucial sub-section because it gives insight into the situation on the ground versus government proclamations, at least on paper. It is worth noting that chiefs and police officers pointed out the mitigation strategies that were lacking in their communities. Chief Nine highlighted this: "Our government must ask teachers to help fight GBV by making pupils come up with songs and plays that can be used on the television as campaign awareness on a daily basis." This is a valid suggestion and such awareness campaigns can feature on the Lesotho television daily and during prime time. Taking a cue from scholars such as Barlose (2015), the current research study envisages that Lesotho's Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation is envisaged to take note of these discrepancies and improve its endeavours to bring about positive changes in people's lives.

The chiefs and police officers highlighted numerous GBV mitigation strategies, which are not on the list of GBV mitigation strategies employed by the Lesotho government. Police Office One cited this: "The offenders that we arrest can be used after servicing their sentences to come and talk about the dangers of committing crimes such as GBV. Ex-prisoners can work with us to move around in schools and gatherings organised by chiefs within communities. We need vehicles and money to do that." Landis (2020) recommends that all government ministries and organisations implementing humanitarian programming should prioritise GBV risk mitigation measures.

Training of police officers

The present study confirms that the government of Lesotho ought to include a variety of GBV mitigation strategies in its policy documents. For instance, Chief Seven alluded to the following: “The government ought to empower police officers and chiefs with special skills; improved police visibility; monitoring of ex-prisoners; involvement of education system; and conducting GBV awareness campaigns, placing focus on masculinity issues.” This finding came out against the backdrop that police officers and chiefs in Lesotho lack skills to deal with GBV cases involving people with special needs, such as the deaf and minors, hence they ought to be empowered through training in areas such as counselling and sign language to improve their proficiency in handling such special cases. The findings also suggest that the two institutions (police and correctional services) are not working together to monitor ex-offenders. Afdal et al. (2020) recommend counselling courses for officials dealing with abused women to restore their psychological well-being.

Improved visibility of police officers

As highlighted by the South African Government (2020), police officers should be more visible in the communities. Police Officer Eight noted this: Lesotho government is not ensuring police visibility through adequate resourcing of its police force by means such as increasing numbers of police stations and staff, and provision of adequate transport. In this regard, transport will be in the form of bicycles, motorbikes and motor vehicles. Highlighting the importance of transport in policing activities, Dawson (2019) stresses that it helps police officers to conduct patrols and other work-related errands effectively.

Monitoring ex-prisoners

Furthermore, Chief Ten highlighted this: “The police ought to monitor ex-prisoners to ensure that they are not committing GBV activities again.” This is a valid GBV mitigation strategy, given that once ex-prisoners are aware that there is such a programme, it is anticipated that it will restrain them from relapsing into crime. Chief Three indicated the following: “The police need to ensure that all perpetrators who try to run away from the law are apprehended.” Both of the strategies fall within the macrolevel of Heise’s (1998) VAW model.

Involvement in the education system

Chiefs and police officers concur that schools ought to be utilised as agencies of positive socialisation by educating learners about GBV issues constantly. This is something that the participants highlighted that the Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation is not constantly doing. This mitigation strategy would entail strong cooperation between the Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation and the Ministry of Education, especially in ensuring that the schools have teachers who are properly trained to communicate GBV matters to young children. Chief Nine, is of this view: “The Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation is not being active and its officials should be visible in communities and must communicate about GBV issues constantly.” This strategy falls within the macro level of the VAW model suggested by Heise (1998).

Conclusion

This research investigated how the Lesotho government combats GBV on paper and the ground. This was based on the various national documents, such as the Lesotho Constitution, the 2003 Sexual Offences Act, the Gender and Development Policy, and the Standard operating procedures for prevention and response to GBV in Lesotho. The findings reveal a significant disconnect between policy pronouncements and practical implementation. By addressing the identified discrepancies

through targeted training, increased resource allocation, strengthened collaboration, and more robust awareness campaigns, the Lesotho government can significantly strengthen its fight against GBV. Lastly, discrepancies between national strategies and study findings were highlighted. Some of the discrepancies include: lack of constant GBV awareness campaigns, failure to relentlessly use numerous poems, drama and songs in GBV awareness campaigns, not using ex-prisoners and failure to utilise people in authority. Most of the lacking mitigation strategies fall within the macro level of Heise's VAW model, meaning the government of Lesotho still has a lot to do in combating GBV. The pervasiveness of GBV in Lesotho warrants the funding of empirical studies by the government and civic organisations to ensure evidence-based solutions. There were some discrepancies between national strategies and the situation on the ground.

Policy recommendations

- Police officers should constantly monitor ex-prisoners, particularly former GBV perpetrators. The constant monitoring of former GBV perpetrators prisoners ensures that they do not relapse and that they become fully reformed.
- Fully reformed ex-prisoners should be utilised in GBV awareness campaigns that target mostly men and boys.
- Ministry of Education should incorporate GBV issues in its curriculum so pupils can learn about this societal scourge at an early age, and to raise awareness about GBV within communities.
- The Ministry of Gender and Youth, Sports and Recreation should offer numerous platforms for the public to share their experiences and opinions regarding GBV utilising the media, songs, dramas and poems.
- The Lesotho government should ensure continuous monitoring and evaluation of the implemented strategies.
- Lesotho government should prioritise evidence-based GBV interventions.

References

- African Union (2003). African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa. Maputo: AU.
- Afdal, A., Alizamara, A., Ifdila, I., Erlamsyaha, E. & Taufik, T. (2017). Guidance and Counseling Services for Women Victims of Domestic Violence. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 118: 935-939.
- Barlose, J. (2015). *Violence against women and girls*. New Delhi: Aleph.
- Barnett, H. (2016). *Constitutional and administrative law*, New York: Oxon.
- Chitando, E. & Chirongoma, S. (2012). Power, Introduction, *Redemptive Masculinities: Men, HIV and Religion*, eds. E. Chitando and S. Chirongoma, Geneva: WCC Publications, 1-28.
- Creswell, J. & Creswell, J. (2018). *Research Design*. London: Sage.
- Davies, S.E. & True, J. (2017). When there is no justice: gendered violence and harm in post-conflict Sri Lanka, *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 21(9), 1320-1336.

- Dawson, J. (2019). Fighting Stress in the Law Enforcement Community. *National Institute of Justice*. 281, 1-6.
- de Wet., C. (2007). School violence in Lesotho: the perceptions, experiences and observations of a group of learners, *South African Journal of Education*, 27, 673–689.
- Dim, E.E. (2017). Ethno-regional Dynamics of Intimate Partner Violence Against Women in Nigeria. *Trauma, Violence and Abuse*, 21(5), 870-885.
- Fergus, L. (2012). *Causes of violence against women*. Available at: <http://www.unwomen.org/events/59/expert-group-meeting-prevention-of-violence-against-women-and-girls/> (accessed 12th July 2022).
- Gender Links (2016) *The gender-based violence indicators study: Lesotho*. Available at: <https://genderlinks.org.za> (accessed 11th October 2022).
- Government of Lesotho - GOL (2001). *Constitution of the Kingdom of Lesotho*. Maseru: Government of Lesotho.
- Government of Lesotho - GOL (2003). *Lesotho Sexual Offences Act*. Maseru: Government of Lesotho.
- Government of Lesotho - GOL (2010). *Penal Code*. Maseru: Government of Lesotho.
- Government of Lesotho - GOL (2018). *Gender and Development Policy*. Maseru: Government of Lesotho.
- Graaff, K. (2017). *Masculinities and gender-based violence in South Africa: a study of a masculinities-focused intervention programme*. Sociology PhD Thesis, Stellenbosch University, South Africa.
- Hapazari, J. (2023). The construction of regional masculinities as drivers of sexual violence against women in Lesotho. *South African Review of Sociology*, 53(2). Online. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21528586.2023.2253526>
- Harvey, L. (2020) *Social research glossary*. New York: Quality Research International.
- Heise, L. (1998) *Violence against women: An integrated, Ecological framework*. London: Sage.
- International Labour Organization - ILO (2019) *C190 - Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No 190)*. Geneva: ILO.
- Jewkes, R., Stern, E. & Ramsoomar, L. (2019) *Community activism approaches to shift harmful gender attitudes, roles and social norms*. London: WhatWorks.
- Kabi, P. (2018). Another gruesome killing. Available at: <https://sundayexpress.co.ls/another-gruesome-killing/> (accessed 5th March 2022).
- Katz, J. (2006). *The Macho Paradox: Why some men hurt women and how all men can help*. Naperville, IL: Sourcebooks, Inc.

- Koeshe, N. (2020). Gender-based violence cases rise during lockdown: Phamotse. *Sunday Express* (April, 21).
- Konyana, E. (2016). *When culture and the law meet: an ethical analysis of the interplay between the domestic violence act and the traditional beliefs and cultural practices of the Ndau people in Zimbabwe*. PhD Thesis, School of religion, philosophy and classics, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa.
- Landis, D. (2020). Gender-based violence and COVID-19: The complexities responding to ‘the shadow pandemic’. *Policy Brief*, 1-14.
- Latham, G.J. (2016). *Patriarchal violence*. Budapest: Habeas Corpus.
- Lester, A. & Pandey, M. (2023). Exploring the Normalisation of Rape as Gender-Based Violence in Lesotho, in Lester, A. & Pandey, M. (Eds). *International Perspectives on Gender-Based Violence*, pp.67-85. DOI:10.1007/978-3-031-42867-8_5.
- Mabale, T. (2020). *Lebollo and Gender-Based Violence Perceptions of Men in Lesotho*. Masters Thesis, Uppsala University.
- Moyo, F.L. (2005). Sex, Gender, Power and HIV/AIDS in Malawi: Threats and Challenges to Women Being Church. *Journal for Constructive Theology*, 10(1), 85-102.
- Oche, O., Adamu, H., Abubakar, A., Aliyu, M. & Dogondaji, A. (2020). Intimate partner violence in pregnancy: Knowledge and experiences of pregnant women and controlling behaviour of partners in Sokoto, North-West Nigeria. *International Journal of Reproductive Medicine*, 2020, 1-10.
- Pathak, V. (2017). Phenomenological research: A study of lived experiences. *Ijariie Journal*, 3(1), 1719-1722.
- Perrin, N., Marsh, M., Clough, A., Desgropes, A., Phanuel, C.Y., Abdi, A., Kaburu, F., Heitmann, S., Yamashina, M., Ross, B., Read-Hamilton, S., Turner, R., Heise, L. & Glass, N. (2019). Social norms and beliefs about gender-based violence scale: a measure for use with gender-based violence prevention programs in low-resource and humanitarian settings. *Conflict and Health*, 13(6), 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-019-0189-x>
- Reisman J. (2019). *The Definition of Social Policy*. Palgrave, Macmillan: London.
- SADC (2008). *Protocol on Gender and Development*.
- Sinant, B. (2021). *A Critical-Legal Overview of the Concept of Constitution*. Tetovo: Ilindenska.
- South African Government. (2020). *Fighting Crime*. Available at: <https://www.gov.za/issues/fighting-crime> (accessed 21st September 2022).
- United Nations - UN (2020). Human Rights Watch submission to the UN special rapporteur on violence against women. *Human Rights Watch* (May, 22).
- United Nations - UN (2003). *Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights*. Washington DC: UN.

UNDP. (2016). *Human Development for Everyone: Briefing note or countries on the 2016*. Maseru: UNDP.

United Nations Population Fund - UNFPA (2020a). *COVID-19 lockdown exacerbates gender-based violence cases in Lesotho*. Maseru: UNFPA.

United Nations Population Fund - UNFPA (2020b). *Gender-based violence*. Geneva. UNPF.

Vonarx, N. (2015). *Masculinity*. Quebec: CECI.

WHO (2020). *The Ecological framework*. Available at: <https://www.who.int/violenceprevention/approach/ecology/en/> (accessed 19th September 2022)

Establishing a Consensus-Based Meaning of ‘Universal Health Coverage’ and Report on its History and Practice

Godfrey Martin Mubyazi¹

Abstract

Debate on the conceptual meaning, evolution, practice and development of Universal Health Coverage continues globally. Questions raised are mainly about the definition of universal health coverage given by the World Health Organization at the beginning of the last decade and on the inconsistent reports on such a concept’s evolution, practical translation, and development. This article accounts for the doubts expressed by various stakeholders about the universal health coverage concept. It gives a synopsis on various authors’ views based on articles selected from internet accessible journals, textbooks, working papers, and fact sheets. Other articles were traced in physical libraries as long as each indicated an account made on the conceptual meaning of universal health coverage and its field feasibility within and between countries. In general, majority of authors call for a renewed meaning of universal health coverage since the one presented by the World Health Organization seems narrow as it emphasizes the issue of quality healthcare delivery and the financing affordability of such a care unlike the broader World Health Organization’s meaning of ‘health’ given in the mid-1940’s. The universal health coverage’s outstanding World Health Organization definition is also found somewhat vague, generalizing a fact about its feasibility in any given country and to allow inter-country comparisons while there are obvious differences in physical environments and in social-cultural, economic and other contextual conditions within and between countries. There is also a disagreement that universal health coverage is a new concept, carpeting the truth that it has roots anchored in the fundamental human rights movement and the World Health Organization’s given definition of ‘health’ that evolved in the 1940’s, with the idea being extended, and to evolve again in the 1978’s Alma-Ata Declaration of ‘Better Health for All’ under the ‘Primary Health Care’ concept. Further, new terminologies like ‘global health’, ‘global public health’, and ‘one health’ evolving one after another seem a duplicate of the aforementioned concepts. In conclusion, call is made for the world to reach a consensus on the fitting meaning, history, practice and development of universal health coverage.

Keywords: universal, health services, primary health care, health financing, equity

Introduction

Universal Health Coverage (UHC) is a concept being hotly discussed in health equity related global, regional and specific country policy and research forums. It has featured in the Millennium Development Agenda and has been extended to be realized as part of targets set for the Sustainable Development Agenda (Kuper & Henefeld, 2018; Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019). The World Health Organization (WHO) defines the term UHC as a state of individuals or communities accessing quality healthcare services comprising of promotive, preventive, treatment, curative, rehabilitative or palliative care without financial limitations when and where they need them (WHO, 2010; WHO, 2024a). Essentially, UHC is pro-equality and equity in health-related policies whose evolution is traced far back in the history of human development agenda relating to health. Therefore,

¹ Chief Research Officer, National Institute for Medical Research (NIMR), Email: gmmubyazi@gmail.com

the current UHC's leading position in the ongoing healthcare policies and research debates that seem to drive the global health financing policy agenda is a continuation of such history (Rifkin, 2018a,b; Verrecchia et al., 2019).

Discussants continue to use most of their time in identifying UHC's conceptual meaning, operational possibility or limitations, and the variations in both the meanings and practices within or between countries. Thus, in both the high-income countries (HICs) and the low-and-middle-income (LMIC) ones, there is yet a debate on these UHC related issues (Wenham et al., 2019; Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019; Mulinde & Prince, 2023; Moosa, 2023). In spite of WHO's attempts to respond to questions raised by critics through various fora using its own publications (WHO, 2020; WHO, 2023a, b; WHO & World Bank, 2023), questions and doubts on the real UHC's meaning and its field practicability remain (Kuper & Henefeld, 2018). Countries listed by UHC in their health inequality reduction related agendas are found to lack uniformity, and likewise the programmes instituted to ensure this vary within and across socio-economic and healthcare contexts (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019). Therefore, the continuing discourse on UHC suggests a need for reaching a consensus.

Conceptual Framework

Criticism sometimes becomes an opportunity for the criticized party to learn or think of better ways to approach and handle a situation. It helps one to improve ways of thinking about things and correct mistakes as per the cliché "We learn through mistakes" (Shallenberger, 2015; Weinzimmer & Esken, 2017). In other words, not all criticisms have negative outcome; some of them are constructive (Beall et al., 2019). The current article builds arguments on the observations made by other analysts through their publications on the UHC topic and with reference to WHO's given UHC definition and its claimed feasibility in all countries. The article also discusses the reported UHC's evolution and development. Targeted in this article are researchers, healthcare practitioners, healthcare financing policy-makers, politicians, managers (amongst whom are health planners), academicians, medical and allied professional students, and other pro-equity policy advocates in both government and private sector departments.

Methodology

An overview of the literature was done to first of all gain insight(s) on both past and contemporary debate on the UHC concept. The reference documents as cited in this article include mainly peer-review journals and textbooks accessed partly by approaching private sources such as colleagues known to work as researchers in the field of health policy and health financing, visiting physical libraries including those belonging to health research institutions and universities with medical schools in Dar es Salaam, as well as the majority of the articles being accessed from the internet. To identify the articles relevant for use in relation to the current article, the first step was to identify terminology considered as key, by typing such words in search engines as google, Medline, Health Inter Network Access to Research Initiative (HINARI) and PubMed® (WHO 2024b). Such words included 'universal coverage', 'primary health care', 'health inequalities', 'developing countries', 'infectious/communicable diseases' and 'non-communicable diseases', 'debate', 'criticisms', and 'controversy'. To maximize the search, two or more of these words were typed in combination by putting either the word 'AND' or a 'plus (+) symbol between one word and the other (Mubyazi & Gutton, 2012). From the beginning, the plan was not to conduct a systematic review as there were articles already made on this topic by other authors. Instead, a selection was made of articles

perceived to be relevant to this article by virtue of their titles and abstracts. Attention was paid to articles published in peer-reviewed journals as these were easier to access online. However, textbooks and other relevant sources such as official blogs were identified, read and critically evaluated. Subjectivism in journal articles and other reading materials was obviously noted when it came to the nature of the literature to include or exclude, but the intention was not to report the number of articles covering the topic rather than the contents of the few articles selected, in relation to the subject matter in question. The article begins with an overview of the prevailing debate on the concept 'UHC' based on WHO's earlier definition.

Results

UHC Meanings and Representativeness

Among other published articles, the Tulchinsky and Varavikova (2014) one, with a focus on public health, is worthy of recognition since it describes health in a broad manner since all the key areas touching on populations' health and wellbeing in general, have been considered. Acknowledged also are articles published four years later by Rifkin (2018a,b) concerning primary health care (PHC) and its linkage with the birth of the UHC concept. Tulchinsky and Varavikova (2014) argue that in 2006 a *Health in All Policy* concept emerged, emphasizing the need for regarding health as a basic component of all public and private policies if the potential of public health improvement and the target of eliminating the existing inequalities that were associated with social and economic conditions were to be achieved. van Druten et al. (2022) also emphasizes the generally regarded cross-cutting, multisector, multidisciplinary and multifaceted wellbeing variable nature of health. These authors argue in support of this view with reference to the definition of health as presented by WHO in the 1940s. Indeed, WHO acknowledges the broad and multifaceted nature of health. It stresses the need for all people to live in good health and in the spirit of UHC, such people need to be assured of access to all the essential healthcare services delivered in a standard manner with acceptable quality when and where they are needed (WHO, 2024a). The same organization also emphasizes that, to achieve the latter goal, consideration of time and context specific conditions is important, with attempts made for striving to confront and overcome the likely challenges through joint and holistic actions (Abihiro & Allegri 2015; WHO 2024a). Further, WHO insists on looking at health from its multiple determinants. It calls for consideration of the determinants with indirect or direct influence on health, either positively or negatively. Giving some examples, such determinants as individuals' or households' income statuses, social protection mechanisms, access to - basic education, employment opportunities and job security, working life conditions, assurance of basic nutrition (food security), living in standard houses, access to other basic life amenities such as water and means of transport, living in friendly physical environment, early childhood development, experience of social inclusion or non-discrimination, structural conflict avoidance or resolution, and access to affordable health services of decent quality, are very important to be taken into account (WHO 2024a,c).

Apart from WHO, almost all other authors argue by identifying weaknesses in the UHC definition as presented by WHO at the beginning of the last decade. They point out such a concept's limited meaning (Tulchinsky and Varavikova 2014; Abihiro and Allegri 2015; Arredondo et al., 2020; Verreccia et al., 2019; UN Women 2020; Endalamaw 2022; van Druten, 2022; Darrudi et al., 2022). In UN Women (2020)'s view, the WHO's definition on UHC leaves out specific gender-oriented concerns, for instance, by not explicitly stating them. As argued, gender sensitive variables are crucial when framing the problems, and when identifying and gathering data, generating or confirming

evidence, and ultimately designing and implementing policies and programmes. Such a view was shared before by Peters et al. (2008) and later on by other observers (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015); Sen et al., 2019; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019).

Additional examples regarding UHC's definition narrowness have been given with reference to the continually observed contextually different experiences in political climates, imitation of certain traditional and cultural values limiting individuals or communities to have chances of accessing essential healthcare services (Borgonovi & Compagni, 2013; Sen et al., 2019; UN Women, 2020), aside the prevailing weak health system's governance or leadership capacity deficiencies noted especially in LMICs to translate UHC related policies and programmes into practice (Borgonovi & Compagni, 2013; Thomson et al., 2017; Arredondo et al., 2019; Wenham et al., 2019; Assan et al., 2019; Joar et al., 2021).

Articles written by Rifkin (2018a,b) provide realistic accounts on UHC's conceptual meaning limitations, genesis and development. As argued, the outstanding WHO's given definition on the concept needs some improvement, having been conceived as an integral part of the global *Sustainable Development Agenda*, with seventeen goals, some of which are concerned with health affairs (WHO 2018). Rifkin (2018a,b) joins Abihiro and Allegri (2015) who earlier commented on WHO's UHC definition. These authors call upon the international community to reconsider the latter definition and come up with a revised version. Arguing against WHO's given definition, Abihiro and Allegri (2015) and then Rifkin (2018ab) point to a lack of field-based evidence that is reliable on UHC's understandability or interpretation and feasibility in different country socio-economic and health systems' contexts. The respective authors criticise the same definition as it seems to limit the focus on health from only a delivery and accessibility of quality of healthcare services and such services' affordability from a financial viewpoint. With such a focus, other social determinants that have impact on health are underrated or uncovered. Psychology experts have noted that a person's happiness or life satisfaction having a bearing on his or her general health and wellbeing status is sometimes dependent on factors other than finance/money (Diener et al., 2010; Lagarde et al., 2019). Medical evidence has not challenged the latter fact, for example, one's lack of freedom to exercise a social or a political right (UN Women, 2020; WHO & The World Bank 2023), lack of cooperation from society members (Dunn, 2016; Surkalim et al., 2022; Akhter-Khan et al., 2023), and living in physically unfriendly environment due to bad weather conditions or frequent episodes of infectious and life-threatening diseases (Salas & Jha, 2019; Chamla & Vivas-Torrealba, 2020; Das et al., 2018).

Barron et al. (2023) have different observation from the majority of authors, claiming the UHC's definition as given by WHO is inadequate in representing key health-related issues or elements. In Barron et al's view, UHC is a concept sometimes misunderstood by those considering providing all available health services and products for free to every person through national health insurance schemes, with uniformity in UHC concept's field action-oriented translation in all countries. Such a claim is contrary to the actual intention of WHO and retains in its given definition. The same authors also do not agree with other authors claiming that WHO overlooked its UHC definition the non-health elements that have a connection to people's health either directly or indirectly. Such a line of thinking is wrong since expressly WHO emphasised the responsibility of each government to determine the course of action in her own context, by considering how the people of different ages, gender and other demographic differences can access essential health services at affordable cost. Verily, WHO underlines the latter point with emphasis that each country has a different path to achieving UHC and

to deciding on what to cover based on the needs of her population and the resources at hand. It also specifies that, the respective country has to increase or direct her investment in PHC whereby all key needs are identified, prioritized and addressed in an integrated way through a comprehensive healthcare system. The latter system is one fully equipped with essential healthcare workforce, and with supporting infrastructural facilities, medicines, working instruments and essential consumables. Further, all sectors in the society have to be given a chance to contribute to the delivery of services and to confront the existing or emerging environmental and socio-economic factors that affect personal or public health and well-being (WHO, 2024a).

The Vagueness of UHC Definition

Vagueness of WHO's meaning of the term UHC is identified by several authors as being reflected partly by other related words. For instance, the word 'universal', according to the Oxford Dictionary, is reported as seeming to stand for something common or applicable to everybody. Therefore, when it is juxtaposed with the word 'health' to form the term 'universal health', the meaning becomes broader than the one described by WHO in the UHC definition. Health as defined by WHO around mid-1940s has a broader meaning since it is more inclusive than just covering issues of health services and their financing (Rifkin, 2018a,b). Meanwhile, the universality of health is questioned by the scholars since sometimes health is regarded as a private or a personal concern (Wenham et al., 2019; Das et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2020; Endalamaw 2022; van Druten et al., 2022).

According to Holst (2020), Universal Health reflects what other authors phrase as 'global [public] health' (Tulchinsky & Varavikova, 2014; Verrecchia et al., 2019; Bhalotra et al., 2019; Jakovljevic et al., 2021); and for this reason, such words may seem to be used interchangeably while they should not. Holst also points to the use of the term 'global health security, as reported elsewhere (Wenham et al., 2019), his concern being that, using either terminology amongst these is more politically oriented toward safeguarding particular political ideologies or interests. First of all, there is yet failure to attain fully the ambitious goal – 'the UHC one'. Secondly, the latter term/phrase overgeneralizes the respective UHC interpretation, besides the phrase 'UHC' taking a biomedical [or biotechnological] reductionism' orientation. In particular, the words Universal Health have limited focus on two dimensions only, delivery of quality healthcare service and the individuals' or communities' ability to access such services without facing financial difficulties (WHO, 2010) when and where they need them (WHO, 2024a).

van Druten et al. (2022) question WHO for apparently rationalizing UHC as a concept which is implementable and assuming the possibility that the state of people's health can be completely 'good' as reflected in its mid-1940's definition of health. The latter view or assumption sounds utopian as it represents an unfeasible state of affairs. WHO's definition of health also overlooks the possibility of people eventually getting serious illness and recovering at least partially.

Definitional Over-Ambitiousness

WHO and their partnering global bodies such as The World Bank believe in the achievability of the UHC goal in all countries. They assume the respective countries having well-established healthcare systems and having the chance for making the necessary improvements based on the existing or the emerging deficiencies (WHO & World Bank, 2023; WHO, 2024a). Along with such a belief is the possibility that the respective countries' governments have a strong political will to keep their promises by fulfilling their declared commitments for setting additional budgets or earmarking new

ones in attempting to meet the prevailing health needs. Such beliefs and assumptions have not been practically demonstrated in most countries, especially in the low-and-middle-income ones (Travis et al., 2005; Tangcharoensathien et al., 2015; Bloom et al., 2018; Arredondo et al., 2020; Soucat et al., 2023; WHO & The World Bank, 2023).

Surveys undertaken by WHO in cooperation with other multilateral agencies in countries selected around the world while tracking the progress so far made towards UHC goal attainment using standardized indicators and data collection and analysis methodologies are also debated due to the noted limitations in arriving at conclusions using the unreasonably justified indices. There are unclear or inconsistent bases or criteria for making comparisons both intra-country-wise and inter-country-wise (Travis et al., 2005; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019; Bhalotra et al., 2019; Arredondo et al., 2020; Endalamaw et al., 2022). HICs are found to have moved some steps ahead towards UHC achievement, ahead of LMIC ones because of their advancement in technologies as used in their healthcare systems and having proportionately a more skilled healthcare workforce and more equipped healthcare infrastructure, with better financed healthcare budgets needed for meeting the demanded healthcare services including those of emergence type. Such HICs are also found to have healthcare systems operating within somewhat stronger governance structures than the LMIC-based ones (Travis et al., 2005; Peters et al., 2008), besides their experience of alternative and better healthcare markets giving their people a wider chance for choosing between healthcare providers according to their preferences and their abilities to pay for the demanded services (Polin et al., 2021). In LMICs, there remains highly limited health insurance (especially the purely private) systems, besides the yet limited accessibility of the existing public or semi-public ones partly due to the yet highly limited public knowledge about them, and a large number of the people claiming to live or truly living in financial poverty states, as well as low public awareness on the benefits accruable from joining a health insurance scheme (Peters et al., 2008; Bhalotra et al., 2019; Moosa, 2023).

Social, cultural, economic, infrastructural and personnel distributional variations within and between countries, political freedom limitedness or a peace/security instability and nature of the living environments are also found to be some of the major UHC limitations in several LMICs (Abihiro & Allegri 2015; Wenham et al., 2019; Endalamaw et al., 2022), besides the weak or unstable governance systems (UN, 2019; Darrudi et al., 2022; WHO & The World Bank, 2023).

Variation in interpretation made on the issues relating to the phrase ‘universal delivery or accessibility of quality healthcare services’ within and between countries as noted from various authors’ accounts also apparently contribute to the difficulties faced when it comes to reaching a consensus on the ‘international comparability of UHC evolution and progress’, and this is expected given the diversity in the environmental contexts in which UHC is purported or claimed to be realized, besides the yet unforeseen but likely to emerge contextual conditions with variations within and between countries and regions (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019; Arredondo et al., 2020; WHO, 2024a). Bhalotra et al. (2019) argue about the attempt made by several countries to demonstrate achievement of UHC through promoting public engagement in healthcare prepayments such as those of health insurance nature. Cited as examples are the countries located in different regions/continents that have tried out subsidized health insurance schemes e.g. Colombia and the US, and Canada. Other countries are those located in the South-Asian region and the UK. In the US, the Obamacare’s scheme is pinpointed as a typical UHC’s government-based striven demonstration. In the UK and in Canada, an example is cited about the Beveridge model involving differentiated

payment rates having been tried out. Such authors also note that in either of these healthcare financing approaches/models, the agency problems and equity concerns have been found to continue and implying the expected welfare gains from each model that could not fully be realized for UHC purpose.

Bhalotra et al. (2019) also identify the challenges indicated by highly competitive demands for the resources required for fulfilling other important public welfare-related needs. Evidence from all over Africa shows that the strive for achieving universal health insurance continues to be promoted even by high-level politicians and the policy-making authorities. Nevertheless, there is still a hot debate about what is the best health insurance (HI) system to go for in terms of its members' enrolment, affordability, acceptability and sustainability. Some of those arguing in favour of private HI claim that it is either an alternative or a supplement to a more social one. However, a purely private HI system is claimed by other critics as limiting the intended services to the more affluent people, therefore, denying accessibility to the poor individuals or families. Meanwhile, a co-running of any given HI scheme is challenged due to the commonly noted chronic governance weakness. Additionally, the more social an HI scheme is, the more likely it is to hinder the individuals who are informally employed to register since their traceability is tricky (Soucat et al., 2023).

It is further noted that in Africa and elsewhere, no single model of HI has so far been found to demonstrate the desired level of success in reaching the essential healthcare services for all the people (Darrudi et al., 2022; WHO, 2023a,b; WHO, 2024a). Therefore, a mixture or combination of UHC intervention-oriented models such as those directly focusing on health services and those considering social and environmental determinants of health with interactive or confounding attributes are proposed. Such models should however be backed by carefully thought-out legal, economic, social, and political policies and enforceable implementation plans or courses of action (The World Bank, JICA & WHO, 2016).

In the spirit of UHC, emphasis is also put on countries to ensure that there is 'progressive universalism' by extending/increasing population coverage whereby the poorest and vulnerable segments of society are not left behind (WHO, 2010). Suggestions are made about the need for 'strategic purchasing' that involves an attempt to expand the statutory benefits package and developing incentives for its effective delivery by health-care providers. This is possible if there are mechanisms reliable for raising the revenues needed for the financing of the desired or the recommended healthcare services in fiscally sustainable ways, improving availability and quality of health-care providers; and strengthening accountability to ensure the fulfilment of promises made between citizens, governments and health institutions (Cotlear et al., 2018). Health care insurance is acknowledged for having moved a great step ahead towards achieving UHC. However, they still face a small proportion of residents living with difficulties in financing their healthcare needs (Zieff et al., 2020; Meinhardt, 2021). Meanwhile, the trending increase in healthcare-related costs partly due to the escalating prices of health commodity prices, increased demand for specialized and emergency care, concurrently with serious shortages in the numbers of skilled workforce, increasing aging population putting more pressure for old age healthcare demand, along with an increase in the burden of non-communicable diseases and their increasing burden trend while concurrently existing sometimes with certain chronic oral variables or factors are taken into account (UN, 2019; WHO, 2023a) and life-threatening infectious of viral or bacterial nature, adding to the occasional episodes

of other exogenous shocks, especially in LMICs (UN 2019; Polin et al., 2021; WHO & The World Bank, 2023).

To minimize the debate or the queries raised on the subject, WHO keeps on publishing through fact sheets accessible online, text books, working papers, journal-based articles and other forms of publications about the right interpretation of the concept (WHO, 2024a). Nonetheless, the facts presented are judged as being excessively defensive and less convincing to clear the doubt and to close the debate chapter. Rifkin's (2018a, b) articles shed more light on the source of the debate and the challenges aimed at WHO, that in year 2005, just five years after the beginning of the implementation of the MDA, confessed having got evidence on the inadequate and a naïve nature of the strategies and interventions established or implemented in the yet resource highly-constrained healthcare systems. In the same vein, WHO itself within eight years following the MDA's conception reported to confirm that there were several challenges brought about by the emergence of new infectious pathogens on top of the already growing burden of NCDs and in the midst of the trending change in global market and economic policy situations, therefore, posing a question about the UHC's goal attainment possibility, especially in LMICs (WHO, 2007).

A Debate on Mixed Reports about the Evolution of the UHC Concept

Some analysts find the UHC concept an old one and a continuation of the Primary Health Care concept that emerged in the 1970s and even the ideas that emerged far back in the 1940s when the United Nations declared the so-popular Fundamental Human Rights and subsequently the 1948 definition of health given by WHO. These authors, among many others (uncited in this paper) also comment on the MDGs as the predecessor of the current sustainable development agenda, with specifically the agenda number three (SDG 3.8) focusing on health (Rifkin 2018a,b; Bloom et al., 2018; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019; Ranabhat et al., 2023). Tulchinsky and Varavikova (2014) express their appreciation of such declared fundamental human rights, but still noting that the rights-based view of health is older than its generally believed or claimed birthdate in the 1940s. These authors cite ancient people as having thought about the right to knowledge of healthful lifestyles and the right to access measures of good health beyond the individuals or the society's ability to provide for themselves. Such an outlook confirms an existing relationship between the respective ancestors' way of thinking and the classical Greek and Biblical traditions that governed applications in a broader term of the new knowledge and experience of public health and the medical care of the 19th and 20th centuries. This is a vision continued in the early years of the 21st century. Burkart et al. (2018) concur with these views by also arguing that UHC notion's birthdate is traced far back to when the ancient people started to live in permanent settlements and eventually shared some of their key responsibilities, one of them being that of caring for the small children at home when others were away attending particular commitments.

Ranabhat et al. (2023) agree with Rifkin (2018a,b) and other authors citing the resolutions reached at by delegates from different countries at a conference held in Alma-Ata City as they argue, "The goal of UHC from the UN has metamorphosed from its early phase of PHC to the recent SDG" (p. 01). In 1997, just three years before the deadline set for attaining the Primary Health Care (PHC)'s goal was reached, the world had realized a still long way to go towards attaining the Health for All goal as per the PHC concept. This idea was accepted by the members of the World Health Assembly attended by representatives from different countries. This gave birth to the Millennium Development Agenda (MDA), with seventeen goals to be attained by 2015 – the '*Millennium Development Goals*' (MDGs).

Thirteen years later, the 30th anniversary of the Alma-Ata Declaration was celebrated, the main emphasis being on striving for the world to accelerate the principles of equity in health as initially advocated under the PHC philosophy and ensuring public health and solidarity in health matters (WHO, 2007), hence a reaffirmation of the PHC philosophy within the MDA implementation period (Bloom et al., 2018).

In general, all the old and contemporary authors refer to UHC as the concept or the ideology that came out following the experience gained from what was not achieved under the period in which attempts were being made to translate the PHC principles into practice, therefore, not being a new idea at all but just an extended form of the latter principles. The birth of the UHC concept has marked WHO, urging all countries to ensure that they have healthcare systems that are people-centred and having strong and supportive leadership systems that provide for accountability of all the stakeholders including those who make key health-related policies and management decisions (Tulchinsky & Varavikova, 2014; Rifkin, 2018a,b; Bloom et al., 2018). On the 12th day of December, 2012, the UN General Assembly endorsed a resolution calling upon all UN member countries to accelerate the progress toward UHC and five years later, it proclaimed December an official UN-designated day, namely, *International UHC Day*, to commemorate the global movement towards full realization of UHC. All the current and the potential stakeholders were to be more sensitized to work toward UHC attainment as long as there was a strong political will demonstrated by real actions for increasing resources to finance delivery of essential healthcare services accessible by all. Unfortunately, the UHC goal was not fully achieved within the expected period, mainly due to certain contextual limitations, especially in LMICs, therefore, making critics argue that, such a goal was over-ambitious (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019).

The ongoing political advocacy on SDGs seeming a successor of the MDGs raises another doubt about its practicality or field translation with sufficient or convincing evidence (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial Bloom et al., 2018; Arredondo et al., 2020; Rifkin, 2018a,b; Ranabhat et al., 2023). The debate is currently all about the short period remaining before reaching the SDGs deadline in 2030. Possibly, what might follow is a new world order with a new motto or a new agenda (Tangcharoensathien et al., 2015; De Maeseneer et al., 2020; Kodali et al., 2023; Rabanhat et al., 2023; WHO 2023ab; WHO & The World Bank 2023).

Discussion

Both old and contemporary literature are true stepping stones for whoever attempts to raise any criticism against the outstanding WHO definition of UHC. The selfish behaviour of human beings as pinpointed by some of the above-identified observers/authors justifies the doubt expressed regarding the universality attribute of health. The argument that universal health is just a social and religious morality-oriented concept whose evolvement was backed by the spirit of the fundamental human rights, included amongst which is the claim for the right to live and the right to good health (UN Women, 2020; Barron et al., 2023) cannot be criticised boldly and confidently. In other words, it is better to agree with the parties arguing that the phrased motto ‘health for all’ under the PHC concept born in 1978 and the ‘leaving no one behind’ one under the MDGs born about twelve years later imply the same thing or global interest. Both latter mottos have roots anchored in the global community’s attempt to have the world whereby everyone realizes ‘good health’. Such an outlook is logical and visionary even from a common sense standpoint. However, questions remain to be carefully thought about and coming up with realistic answers. For example, how comes the same

WHO came up with the definition untrusted by various observers? In more specific terms, ‘How comes that focus was limited on quality healthcare services delivery and the financial (payment) affordability of such services and not mentioning other key determinants of health with broader public health meaning? (Borgonovi & Compagni, 2013; Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019) In recognition of the aforementioned latter two mottos – *Leaving No One Behind* and *Health for All*, one given under the PHC philosophy and the other under the MDGs, respectively, WHO has come to confess of the need for reorienting health systems using a PHC approach (WHO, 2024a).

Sen et al. (2019) joining other observers (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; Arredondo et al., 2020; UN Women, 2020) reasonably identify a need for using a gender lens to examine the meaning and relevance of the UHC, and the attempts made towards achieving it from a health system’s perspective. These authors consider the gender power relations found to affect health, especially the health of most vulnerable population groups such as women, girls and small children. In Sen et al.’s view, the ruling WHO definition of UHC does not fit well in all of the six health system’s building blocks (WHO, 2000) because of its narrowness. The present article agrees with the latter author. Continuing with the same definition also puts a limit to parties or authorities charged with the duty of creating or amending the policies and programmes aligned towards solving certain health problems faced by the populations belonging to both genders. The need for reflecting, in the definition, the issue of gender power balance in relation to health and other dimensions of life that affect health, is urgent. Failure to arrive at a common and comprehensive meaning of any policy related concept lays down a stepping stone towards failure in the translation of such a concept in into actual or effective action.

Again, any thinking of a renewed UHC conceptual meaning giving a reflection on the importance of other health dimensions such as those relating to health governance, ensuring people have access to proper health information, stability in the social, political, economic and geographical determinants of health that are cross-sectoral in nature could be more appealing and therefore receive less criticism (Borgonovi & Compagni, 2013). The determinants with a cross-sectoral linkage and with a focus on dimensions other than healthcare services and individuals’ lifestyle choices (WHO, 2024c) include those on social-cultural values like the social norms and traditions that entertain or perpetuate gender imbalances and discrimination whereby male’s power abuses involving unnecessary masculine-oriented beliefs and use of physical strength over females (women, girls, and young children) are to be addressed (Sen et al., 2019; UN Women, 2020).

Professing about UHC goal attainment strategy is one step, but government authorities should keep their promises by demonstrating more actions. They need to ensure that their publicly declared commitment to increase the financial budgets for supporting the programmes or the interventions that have been carefully conceived or designed are realized since action speaks more than words (WHO, 2023a,b). They have to walk their talk, and possibly if they were serious enough to observing this, the debate about the UHC goal unattainability would have been less vigorous. This is why there is a valid point made by those suggesting for a renewed UHC conceptualization and eventual replacement of the currently ruling definition (Abihiro & Allegri, 2015; Rifkin, 2018a,b; Bloom et al., 2018; Das et al., 2018; Jakovjevic et al., 2021; Meinhardt, 2021).

Conclusion

Commends go to WHO at last admitting the reality about some of the criticisms raised so far in relation to the need to continue imbibing the PHC principles by recommending a reorientation of health systems towards a realization of such principles in practice (WHO 2024a). This is an indirect admission of the limited nature of the earlier defined UHC concept. The latter concept indeed needs to be rephrased in its definition, by including other key elements or dimensions of health instead of over-focusing on quality health service delivery and the financing aspect of such services. The new UHC definition can be made to include other cross-cutting variables, of multisectoral and multidisciplinary nature; for example, some lines identifying the significance of living in standard houses, accessing primary education, clean and safe drinking and washing water, living in sanitary and hygienic environment, and preparedness for resilience and adaptability to changes in climate, episodes of other unpredictable environmental conditions such as shocks due to disease outbreaks or epidemics, as long as there is an assured good governance backed by proper legal and policy-making and implementation structures, mechanisms for increasing people's access to appropriate information and technology, transport, and their employability (Borgonovi & Compagni, 2013; The Lancet Public Health Editorial, 2019). Further, UHC's history and development need a presentation that is common or consistent. Otherwise, remaining with a situation whereby UHC as a concept is sugar-coated with periodically fine-tuned names or language and the propagandas just for meeting certain scholars' or technical or political interests that lead individual countries and the world at large to confusion and to nowhere, makes no sense at all.

References

- Abihiro, G.A. & De Allegri, M. (2015). Universal health coverage from multiple perspectives: A synthesis of conceptual literature and global debates. *BMC Int Health Hum Rights*, 4(15):17. doi: 10.1186/s12914-015-0056-9.
- Akhter-Khan, S. C., Prina, M., Wong, G.H.-Y., Mayston, R. & Li, L. (2023). Understanding and addressing older adults' loneliness: The social relationship expectations framework. *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 18(4): 762–777. <https://doi.org/10.1177/17456916221127218>.
- Assan, A., Takian, A., Aikins, M. & Akbarisari, A. (2019). Challenges to achieving universal health coverage through community-based health planning and services delivery approach: A qualitative study in Ghana. *BMJ Open*; 9(2): e024845. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2018-024845.
- Arredondo, A., Recamán, A.L. & Castrejón, B. (2020). Universal health coverage in the framework of the 2030 global agenda for sustainable development: Agreements and challenges. *J Glob Health*, 10(1): 010316. doi: 10.7189/jogh.10.010316.
- Barron, G.C., Koonin, J., Akselrod, H. & Fagstad, H. (2023). Universal health coverage is a matter of equity, rights, and justice. *The Lancet*, 11, e1336. doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(23)00317-0.
- Bhalotra, S., Rocha, R. & Soares, R.R. (2019). Does universalization of health work? Evidence from health systems restructuring and expansion in Brazil. CDEP-CGEP WP No. 71. Centre for Development Economics and Policy, January. cdep.sipa.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/content/WP71Soares.pdf (Accessed on: 19th December, 2023).

- Beall, L., Myers, T.A., Kotcher, J.E., Vraga, E.K. & Maibach, E.W. (2019). Controversy matters: Impacts of topic and solution controversy on the credibility of a scientist who advocates. *PLOS ONE*, 14(1): e0211289. doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0211289.
- Bloom, D.E., Khoury, A. & Subbaraman, R. (2018). The promise and peril of universal health care. *Science*, 361(6404), eaat9644. doi: 10.1126/science.aat9644.
- Burkart, J.M., Brügger, R.K. & van Schaik, C.P. (2018). Evolutionary origins of morality: Insights from non-human primates. *Front. Sociol.* 3, (17), doi: 10.3389/fsoc.2018.00017.
- Borgonovi, E. & Compagni, A. (2013). Sustaining universal health coverage: The interaction of social, political, and economic sustainability. *Value in Health*, 16, S534-S538. doi.org/10.1016/j.jval.2012.10.006.
- Chamla, D. & Vivas-Torrealba, C. (2020). Universal health coverage in fragile and humanitarian contexts. *Int J Health Policy Manag*, 9(2): 89–90. doi:10.15171/ijhpm.2019.112.
- Cotlear, D. & Rosemberg, N. (2018). Going universal in Africa: How 46 African countries reformed user fees and implemented health care priorities. *Universal Health Care Coverage Series*, 26, World Bank Group, Washington, DC.
- Das, J., Woskie, L., Rajbhandari, R & Abbasi, K. (2018). Rethinking assumptions about delivery of healthcare: implications for universal health coverage. *BMJ*, 361:k1716. doi: 10.1136/bmj.k1716.
- Darrudi, A., Ketabchi, K.M.H. & Tajvar, M. (2022). Challenges to achieving universal health coverage throughout the world: A systematic review. *J Prev Med Public Health*, 55(2), 125–133. doi: 10.3961/jpmph.21.542.
- De Maeseneer J., Li, D. & Palsdottir B. (2020). Universal health coverage and primary health care: the 30 by 2030 campaign. *Bull World Health Organ.*, 98(11), 812–814. doi:10.2471/BLT.19.245670
- Diener, E., Ng, W., Harter, J., & Arora, R. (2010). Wealth and happiness across the world: Material prosperity predicts life evaluation, whereas psychosocial prosperity predicts positive feeling. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 99(1): 52–61. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0018066>.
- Dunn, P. (2016). Waiting for your family to die in order to get an inheritance. Pete The Planner. Available at: petetheplanner.com/waiting-for-your-family-to-die-in-order-to-get-an-inheritance/ (Accessed on 16th August, 2023).
- Endalamaw, A., Gilks, C.F., Ambaw, F. & Assefa, Y. (2022). Universality of universal health coverage: A scoping review. *PLoS ONE*, 17(8): e0269507. doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0269507.
- Holst, J. (2020). The world expects effective global health interventions: Can global health deliver? *Global Public Health*, 15(9): 1396–1403. DOI: [10.1080/17441692.2020.1795222](https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2020.1795222).
- Jakovljevic, M., Ranabhat, C.L., Mohamed Ibrahim, M.I. & Teixeira, J.P. (2021). Editorial: Universal health coverage: The long road ahead for low- and middle-income regions. *Front Public Health*, 11(9), 746651. doi: 10.3389/fpubh.2021.746651.
- Joar, Björk., Terese, S., Niklas, J. & Gunnarsson, A.B. (2021). Personal responsibility for health? A phenomenographic analysis of general practitioners' conceptions. *Scandinavian Journal of Primary Health Care*, 39(3):322–331, OI: 10.1080/02813432.2021.1935048.
- Kodali, P.B. (2023). Achieving universal health coverage in low- and middle-income countries: Challenges for policy post-pandemic and beyond. *Risk Manag Health Policy*, 16:607–621. doi: 10.2147/RMHP.S366759.

- Kuper, H. & Hanefeld, J. (2018). Debate: Can we achieve universal health coverage without a focus on disability? *BMC Health Serv Res.* 2618(1), 738. doi: 10.1186/s12913-018-3547-2.
- Lagarde, M., Huicho, L. & Papaniolas, L. (2019). Motivating provision of high quality care: It is not all about money. *BMJ*, 366: 15210. DOI: 10.1136/bmj.15210.
- Meinhardt, P. (2021). Reinstating universal health coverage on the global agenda. Editorial. *The Lancet*, 398(10316): P2051. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(21\)02742-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(21)02742-2).
- Moosa, S. (2023). Exploring the challenges for universal health coverage: A call to Africa by AfroPHC. *Risk Manag Healthc Policy.* 16:1999-2017 <https://doi.org/10.2147/RMHP.S392454>.
- Mubyazi, G.M. & Hutton, G. (2012). Rhetoric and reality of community participation in health planning, resource allocation and service delivery: A review of the reviews, primary publications and grey literature. *Rwanda Journal of Health Sciences*, 1(1): 51–65.
- Mulinde, J.C. & Prince, R.J. (2023). New universalism? Universal health coverage and debates about rights, solidarity and inequality in Kenya. *Social Science & Medicine*; 319, 115258. doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2022.115258.
- Peters, D.H., Garg, A., Bloom, G., Walker, D.G., Brieger, W.R. & Rahman, M.H. (2008). Poverty and access to health care in developing countries. *Ann. N.Y. Acad. Sci.*, 1136: 161–171, doi.org/10.1196/annals.1425.011.
- Polin, K., Hjortland, M., Maresso, A., van Ginneken, E., Busse, R., Quentin, W. & HSPM Network (2021). “Top-Three” health reforms in 31 high-income countries in 2018 and 2019: An expert informed overview. *Health Policy*, 125(7): 815–832.
- Ranabhat, C.L., Acharya, S.P., Adhikari, C. & Kim, C.B. (2023). Universal health coverage evolution, ongoing trend, and future challenge: A conceptual and historical policy review. *Front Public Health*, 11, 1041459. DoI: <https://doi.10.3389/fpubh.2023.1041459>.
- Rifkin, S.B. (2018a). Rifkin SB. Health for all and primary health care, 1978–2018: A historical perspective on policies and programmes over 40 years. *Oxford Research Encyclopaedia of Global Public Health*; pp. 31. [Published Online on October 18, 2018]. DOI:10.1093/acrefore/9780190632366.013.55.
- Rifkin, S.B. (2018b). Alma Ata after 40 years: Primary health care and health for all—from consensus to complexity. *BMJ Glob Health*, 3(Suppl 3), e001188. doi: 10.1136/bmjgh-2018-001188.
- Salas, R.N. & Jha, A.K. (2019). Climate change threatens the achievement of effective universal healthcare. *BMJ*, 23, 366: 15302. doi: 10.1136/bmj.15302.
- Sen, G., Govender, V. & El-Gamal, S. (2019). Universal health coverage, gender equality and social protection: A health systems approach. Discussion Paper, prepared for the 6th Session of The Commission on The Status of Women. *UN Women*, pp. 48.
- Shallenberger, D. (2015). Learning from our mistakes: International educators reflect. *The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, XXVI, 249–263.
- Soucat, A., Tandon, A. & Gonzales, Pier E. (2023). From universal health coverage services packages to budget appropriation: The long journey to implementation. *BMJ Global Health*, 8, e010755. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2022-010755.
- Surkalim, D.L., Luo, M., Eres, R. & Gebel, K. (2022). The prevalence of loneliness across 113 countries: Systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ*, 376, e067068: doi.org/10.1136/bmj-2021-067068.
- Tangcharoensathien, V., Mills, A. & Palu, T. (2015). Accelerating health equity: The key role of universal health coverage in the Sustainable Development Goals. *BMC Medicine*, 13(1): 1–5. doi: 10.1186/s12916-015-0342-3.

- The Lancet Public Health Editorial (2019). Universal health coverage: Realistic and achievable? *The Lancet Public Health*, 4, e1. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.16/S2458-2667\(18\)30258-8](https://doi.org/10.16/S2458-2667(18)30258-8).
- Thomson, S., Cylus, J. & Evetovits, T. (Eds). (2017). How you measure matters: Monitoring financial protection to generate policy-relevant evidence for universal health coverage—lessons from Europe. *Organized session 9 July 2017. IHEA 12th World Congress in Health Economics*.
- Travis, P., Bennett, S. & Haines, A. (2005). Overcoming health systems constraints to achieve the millennium development goals. *Lancet*, 365, 9456, 294.
- Tulchinsky, T.H. & Varavikova, E.A. (2014). Expanding the concept of public health. *The New Public Health*, 14:43–90. doi: 10.1016/B978-0-12-415766-8.00002-1.
- United Nations (UN). (2019). Achieving universal health coverage by 2030 hinges on ‘Bold National Leadership’. Secretary-General tells General Assembly, as World Leaders Commit to Declaration. High-Level Meeting on Universal Health Care. Available: <https://www.un.org/press/en/2019/ga12181.doc.htm>. (Accessed: 12 July 2019).
- UN Women (2020). Universal health coverage: Gender equality and external protection - A health systems approach. *Working Paper No. 8*.
- van Druten, V.P., Bartels, E.A. & van de Mheen, D. (2022). Concepts of health in different contexts: A scoping review. *BMC Health Serv Res*, 22, 389. doi.org/10.1186/s12913-022-07702-2.
- Verrecchia, R., Thomson, R. & Yates, R. (2019). Universal health coverage and public health: A truly sustainable approach. *The Lancet*, 4, e-10, e-11. doi.org/10.1016/ S2468-2667(18)30264-0.
- Wang, T.T., Nathur, R.M. & Schmidt, H. (2020). Universal health coverage, oral health, equity and personal responsibility. *Bull World Health Organ.* 98, 719–721. doi.org/10.2471/BLT.19.247288.
- Weinzimmer, L.G. & Esken, C.A. (2017). Learning from mistakes: How mistake tolerance positively affects organizational learning and performance. *The Journal of Applied Behavioural Science*, 53(3), 322–348. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0021886316688658>.
- Wenham, C., Katz, R., Birungi, L.B. & Eccleston-Turner, L.B. (2019). Global health security and universal health coverage: from a marriage of convenience to a strategic, effective partnership *BMJ Glob Health*, 4, e001145. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2018-001145.
- World Bank, Global Fund, JICA & WHO (2024). *Universal health coverage in Africa: A framework for action*.
- WHO (2000). *The world health report 2000: Health systems: Improving performance*. Geneva, WHO.
- WHO (2007). *The right to health: Joint fact sheet WHO/OHCHR/323*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- WHO (2010). *The world health report - Health systems financing: The path to universal coverage*. Geneva: Geneva, World Health Organization.
- WHO (2018). Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Geneva, 18th February, 2018. [www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/millennium-development-goals-\(mdgs\)](http://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/millennium-development-goals-(mdgs)). (Accessed on 16th August, 2023).
- WHO (2024a). *Universal health coverage. Overview*. WHO Response, 2030 Agenda for SDGs. https://www.who.int/health-topics/universal-health-coverage#tab=tab_1 (accessed on 11th March, 2024).
- WHO (2024b). *Information sources: HINARI*. Available at: <https://www.emro.who.int/information-resources/hinari/> (Accessed on 5th March, 2024).

- WHO (2024c). *Social determinants of health*. https://www.who.int/health-topics/universal-health-coverage/social-determinants-of-health#tab=tab_1 (Accessed on March 6th, 2024).
- WHO (2023a). *Declaration of Alma-Ata International Conference on Primary Health Care*. Alma-Ata, USSR, 6-12 September 1978. https://cdn.who.int/media/docs/default-source/documents/almaata-declaration-en.pdf?sfvrsn=7b3c2167_2. (Accessed on 16th August, 2023).
- WHO (2023b). *Universal health coverage: Report of the Director General*. EB154/6 154th session 19 December 2023.
- WHO & International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) / The World Bank (2023). *Tracking universal health coverage 2023 global monitoring report*. ISBN (WHO) 978-92-4-008037-9, Geneva.
- Zieff, G., Kerr, Z. Y., Moore, J. B., & Stoner, L. (2020). *Universal healthcare in the United States of America: A healthy debate*. *Medicina* (Kaunas). 30, 56(11); 580. doi: 10.3390/medicina56110580.

Hip-Hop Music, Youth and Mainstream Politics in Tanzania

Jasper Harry Sabuni¹

Abstract

Hip-hop is a music genre which has gained popularity amongst the public over the years. Whereas this particular genre had been unfamiliar to the majority of Tanzanians prior the 1990s, it was however from the second half of the 1990s when this particular art form found haven into the hearts and minds of the public. Like a wildfire, the 2000s witnessed the massive rise and recognition of this particular music genre. As an art form, hip-hop tends to significantly appeal to the youthful mass and particularly to the urban youth dwellers. Moreover, this particular genre is often associated with building and raising political consciousness. Subsequent to its character, attitude and nature, hip-hop has been instrumental towards influencing Tanzanian youths in engaging in mainstream politics and in advocating for democracy and development. The article thus intends to further cast light in understanding the contributions, prospects and limitations of hip-hop music in promoting democratic ideals and principles through the mainstream politics, amongst the Tanzanian youths.

Keywords: Hip-hop, Tanzania, politics, democracy, youth, development

An Overview of the Hip Hop Genre

Hip-Hop in a Nutshell

Hip-hop as a music genre traces its roots from the streets (Rado, 2022). Globally, this genre originated from the African American inner-city culture around the 1970s (Stroeken, 2005). As the term and concept of globalization gained pace, hip-hop thus went ahead to enjoy this trend as it crossed the American borders to celebrate its existence throughout the world (Jilala, 2013).

Beyond the music, this genre extended into visual art, dance, language and politics (Marques, 2023). As hip-hop primarily bares the artistic elements of Djing, Mcing, Breaking and Painting/ Writing, this particular artistic form has transcended to every element of culture. It has actually become a popular culture which has been embraced all over the world.

As the contemporary world has been predominantly neo-liberalized, hip-hop music has not been spared from the capture of the corporate, as it has also become commercialized to a great deal. However, this music genre has remained resolute, as it still maintains its legacy and upholds its roots and origins, of addressing the desperate cries of some of the most oppressed communities in the world (Marques, 2023).

Hip-Hop in Tanzania

As the euphoria of globalization persisted, this culture landed in Tanzania in the 1980s and it was pioneered by the likes of Kwanza Unit (KU), Saleh Jabir, Hard Blasters Crew (HBC), Wagumu Weusi Asilia (WWA), De-plow-matz, Mr. II and Hasheem Dogo, among others (Hanzi, 2015). In his narrative, at Times FM, the iconic and legendary producer Master J. narrates that in its early days,

¹ Freelance Poet, Writer, Researcher and Advocate. Email: kidojasper@gmail.com / cellphone: +255 756 200 197

hip-hop was adopted by the youths of Tanzania by imitating the style, flow and rendition of the American hip-hop style. It was only later however, that the genre was customized and localized through the incorporation of the local musical, social and linguistic practices (Fenn & Perullo, 2008).

As hip-hop found haven into the souls of the few upon its inception due to the fact that it was overwhelmed by an external culture and tradition, by the early 1990s, its contemporary scent appealed to the youths, as there was a fusion of Kiswahili language and culture in the music genre.

So eloquently, two of the most celebrated hip-hop artists and legends, Joseph Haule (famously known as Profesa Jay) and Fareed Kubanda (Fid Q) in their songs *Tathmini* and *Bongo Hip-Hop*, respectively, narrate of the coming and the rise of hip-hop – not only as a music genre, but also as a reckoned and formidable culture. Two of the hip-hop songs from the two artists are provided below.

<p>Original Version Profesa Jay ft. Jay Moe – Tathmini</p> <p><i>Rap si lelemama kama wengi mnavyodhani, fasihi iliyo hai kuitoa jamii gizani. Miaka ya 80 Hip-Hop Bongo ilichipua na nadhani wale wakongwe wa rap hii mnaitambua.</i></p> <p><i>Hali ilikuwa mbaya miaka ya 89, watu hawakutaka kuelewa rap kabisa. Miaka ya 90 Hip-Hop Bongo imekubalika, wenye nia nzuri na rap tunawajibika.</i></p>	<p>Translation Profesa Jay ft. Jay Moe – Analysis</p> <p>Rap isn't as easy as many of you think, [It's] an active form of literature to emancipate the society from darkness.</p> <p>In the 80s hip-hop in Tanzania sprouted, and I think the elders of rap you know this.</p> <p>The situation was bad in 89, [as] people did not want to accept rap at all.</p> <p>It was in the 90s when hip-hop was accepted in Tanzania.</p> <p>Those of us with good intentions with rap keep on being responsible.</p>
<p>Original Version Fid Q – Bongo Hip Hop</p> <p><i>Ulianza wewe/ wakaja waimbaji na wabana pua...</i></p> <p><i>Hip-hop ya ukweli/ ukapigwa redioni/ Sometimes malaika wa heri nao hutembelea motoni/...</i></p> <p><i>BONGO FLAVA mzuri kiasi/ hip-hop we ndo my queen/ My first, my last and everything in between/...</i></p>	<p>Translation Fid Q – Bongo (Tanzanian) Hip Hop</p> <p>[It was] you [who] started, then came the singers and the nasal annoyers...</p> <p>Real hip-hop, you started been played on the radio/ Sometimes the good angel also visits hell/</p> <p>Bongo flava is somehow beautiful but hip-hop you're my queen/ My first, my last & everything in between/...</p>

It was however later, in the late 1990s and 2000s, when the beauty of this art was realized in the ears of the mass; and eventually it made sense. So, it was cherished and celebrated in the minds of the skeptics and the doubting-Thomases, when and where hip-hop artists, with the likes of Prof. Jay and others started addressing serious issues and concerns of the society through their songs.

Different Facets of Hip-Hop Music

Together with its highly acclaimed contribution, the hip-hop music genre is faced with a battle of identification, because what is entailed in hip-hop varies from one school of thought to another. It is thus surely a daunting task to define what hip-hop is and what is not. The two predominant corners in the battle of identification of hip-hop comprises of the conscious wing and the commercial wing, or rather the old-school hip-hop and the new-school hip-hop, respectively. Actually, the sects of hip-hop are far too many to highlight and account for.

Consequent to the factions of the art, hip-hop artists have not been spared from the identity crisis, as they too have become victims of labelling. Different contexts have been used to identify the hip-hop artists. For instance, in the song *Tathmini*, Profesa Jay, using the artistic lens and context of conduct, claims that there are two sets of Tanzanian rappers/ hip-hop artists: real artists and fake artists. He elaborates that real artists are those who are wise enough to think before they rap and the latter are those who rap simply just to get paid.

Other discourses that have been used to cluster and define hip-hop artists are within the lines of language (bi-lingual vs. Kiswahili), generational (old-school vs. new school), style (bum-bump vs. trap) and even the message (hardcore vs. soft-core) – the list is almost endless. In this article, however, reference has been made towards different hip-hop artists and music that have reached and enjoyed the privileges of mainstream (media) platforms – radios, TVs, social media, concerts and so forth – without being significantly bothered by their facets.

Research Questions

This article addresses three primary questions which shall cast light on the discussion and analysis of the topic on hip-hop music, the youth and mainstream politics. The three questions are: what makes hip-hop music appeal to the youth and society? what is the role of hip-hop music in mainstream politics and democracy? and what are the limitations of hip-hop music?

Analysis of Hip-Hop, Youth and Mainstream Politics

Appeal and Embrace of Hip-Hop amongst Youth and the Society

As reckoned earlier, this article regards hip-hop as a popular culture; asserting that hip-hop maintains a strong relation with a significant part of the society, predominantly youth and thus making it popular. Different arguments can be given to attribute to this popularity and formidable and continued relationship with the society. The arguments range from the language discourse to the accessibility of the art or even the hyped promotions. This particular section of the article however takes note of this, and takes into account only three significant elements: the artist, the society's identity to the art and the collective representation of the art. These elements are discussed in the sub-sections that follow.

The Artist

The diverse sets of artists who have ventured into the hip-hop scenery have two predominant features: they are youth (or rather youthful) and they often come from humble and ordinary backgrounds. Youth as a formality may be regarded as those aged below 35 years. Youthfulness, however, refers

to the character and condition of being vibrant, vocal, opinionated, daring and most definitely wild. For example, the likes of Nikki Mbishi, Kiraka Rado and Mr. II (Sugu) may have crossed the 35 year mark, but they are still regarded youthful through their art and lifestyle. This youth and youthful trait has a substantial impact in developing and maintaining the bond between the artist, the young people and the general society.

As for the second feature, artists' first-hand experience of their trials and tribulations has a huge impact in their artistry and in their connection with the society. Taking note of their position, background and even existing realities, the society easily associates with the artists and their art and altogether tend to develop allegiance. As to the society, a hip-hop artist is one of their own, a representative of their realities.

In the song by *Kontawa ft. Ney wa Mitego*, titled *Champion*, the ever critical and vocal hip-hop artist Emmanuel Elibariki (Ney wa Mitego) shared a glimpse of his poor background, accounting for his life hurdles and hustles. His experiences of the past and present make it easy for the society to embrace the artist and see the relevance of hip-hop music. The connection between the artist and society convinces the society to take the lyrics seriously, including the message and call made through his art. Part of the song is reproduced below.

Original Version Champion – Ney wa Mitego	Translation Champion – Ney wa Mitego
<p><i>Ni'shatembea kwa miguu toka Manzese mpaka Temeke</i> <i>Kuomba nafasi ya kuimba na bado na iyo sipati</i> <i>Dharau zao na manyanyaso mli'fanya tamaa n'sikate (dah!)</i> <i>Pumzi inakata, koo linakauka</i></p>	<p>I have walked from Manzese to Temeke Requesting a chance to sing and yet being denied, Their disrespect and humiliation gave me hope (duh!) I am losing my breath, my throat is running dry.</p>

The Art and its Identity

As the saying goes, “*Msanii ni Kioo cha Jamii*” [An artist is a mirror/ reflection of the society]. Hip-hop artists and their music so well account to this narrative. As mentioned earlier, hip-hop artists tend to strongly appeal to the society following their background and status; moreover, the relevance of the genre is further depicted in its artistry. Crafted with sheer zeal, passion and creativity accounting to the actual realities, hip-hop music songs tend to develop bond and connection with the audience. This is particularly the case as the audience and public tend to find identity and also develop a sense of belonging with the songs, since they are able to reflect and associate with the same.

The identity and belonging is often attributed to the lyrics and the flow of the song. The same is also highly influenced by the content and the message in the respective song. Whereas the song, *Masikini Wenzangu* by *Ngwear ft. Mirror*, addressed numerous issues, ranging from corruption, embezzlement to classes, among others, the chorus stresses the relationship between the song and the Tanzanian community. In the song, the authors cry for Tanzania; however, they show that their cry is not theirs

alone, it is actually a national cry, since they say that they are crying with poor Tanzanians, in their large numbers.

From the onset, the title, the introduction and throughout its entire lyrics, the song eloquently and successfully engages and incorporates the public; it perfectly captures the voice of the mass and altogether makes the public part of the authorship of the song. Herein the public is not a mere audience to the song; it is the song, the songwriter and the audience altogether.

Original Version	Translation
<u>Masikini Wenzangu (Ngweir ft Mirror)</u>	<u>My Poor Fellows (Ngweir ft Mirror)</u>
Intro	Intro
<i>Mi' na masikini wenzangu/ Nalia na Tanzania yangu/</i>	I and my poor fellows/ I am crying for my Tanzania/
<i>Bado nalia na Tanzania yangu/ Mimi nalia na masikini wenzangu/</i>	I am still crying for my Tanzania/ I am crying with my fellow poor/
Kiitikio	Chorus
<i>Bado nalia tu na Tanzania yangu/ kweli mali ni nyingi wale wachache wenzangu/</i>	I'm still crying for my Tanzania/ In deed there are lot of wealth, ooh my fellow/
<i>Mi' nalia na masikini wenzangu/ eeh baba Mungu sikia kilo changu/</i>	I'm crying with my poor fellows/ Ooh Lord Father hear my cry/
<i>Issue is harder tuna suffer/ sikia kilio changu/</i>	Issue is harder we are suffering/ hear my cry/
<i>Issue is harder tuna suffer/ me nalia like.../</i>	Issue is harder we are suffering/ I'm crying like...

The Collective Representation

Whereas the genre masters the art of storytelling, the respective stories however do not only seek to represent individualized experiences. The stories shared may often seem personalized but the stories actually resonate with life realities of the community. The song *Wimbo wa Taifa* by *Kala Jeremiah ft. Nakaaya Sumari* well portrays how hip-hop music has power to capture and narrate the experiences of an individual or rather individuals and yet at the same time has its conveyed message transcend beyond the representation of the individual.

In this song, Kala Jeremiah gives an account of the travails facing his sister, brother, aunt and younger brother, amongst others; later on however, the rapper well notes that when and where he points to, and recalls about his brother/sister, he does not entirely mean his actual bloodline sister or brother. Instead, he means any and all the brothers and sisters facing similar concerns. Hence, while other music and artistic genre can enjoy the individualized reflection, the hip-hop genre is a rather socialized genre and hence it tends to well appeal to the society subsequent to its collective nature of representation.

Original Version <u>Wimbo wa Taifa – Kala Jeremiah</u>	Translation <u>Song of the Nation – Kala Jeremiah</u>
<p><i>Sitomlaumu dalali kwa kesi ya ubovu wa rada/ Ila namlaumu Kigogo aliyekesha Bar na dada/ Aliyemfundisha pombe kuichanganya ndani ya soda/ Aliyemnyima shangazi kazi kisa alimtoa uroda/ Dogo Inno yuko ghetto ashafukuzwa ada/ Sista Rozi yuko Keko anauza mwili na msokoto/ Blaza J alikuwa mwizi wameshamtia moto/ Naposema dada simaanishi wa tumbo moja/ Naposema kaka namaanisha yule teja/ Mnayemdisi everytime mnayemtaja kwenye hoja</i></p> <p><i>...Wakati mademu zenu daily wanaruka debe/ Kwa macho yangu namuona kaka yangu mpiga debe/ Mara akamatwe akafungwe akanyee debe/ Aishi vipi hana kazi punguzeni ubabe</i></p>	<p>I won't blame the middle man for the case of a defective radar/ But I will blame the Honorable who stays late at the bar with my sister/ Who taught her how to mix alcohol with soda/ Who denied my aunt employment because she refused to have sex with him/ My young bro Inno is at home, he has been expelled because of fees/ Sister Rose is at Keko as a prostitute and selling drugs/ Brother J was a thief and he has been set of fire/ When I say sister I don't mean of the same womb/ When I say brother, I mean that street wanderer/ Whom you condemn every time and whom you mention in your dialogues/ ...While your ladies are daily partying/ With my two eyes I see my brother street hawking/ After he is arrested, he is taken into custody and thrown into detention/ How can he survive then, he does not have employment, stop your tyranny</p>

Hip-Hop as a Pillar for Democracy

What entails democracy is another matter which attracts intense debate, as there is no one shoe fits all definitions. Despite its differing opinion and assertion, modern democracy, as labeled by the ever-celebrated scholar Samir Amin (Amin, 2011) or rather western bourgeois democracy as coined by the revolutionary activist and scholar Walter Rodney (Rodney, 1973), traces its foundation from the prime principles of the French Revolution - 'Liberty, Equality and Fraternity'. Hence, the contemporary democracy debate advocating for free speech, elections, political equality, equality before the law, multi-party politics, political participation and so forth, are arguably an extension of the three prime elements of the French Revolution.

Whereas democracy has been highly related to the notion of sustainable development, hip-hop music has posed to be an instrumental pillar towards advocating for the realization of both democracy and development. Through its different discourses and mediums – such as live concerts, social media,

radios, televisions, exhibitions and other public channels and gatherings – hip-hop champions for the adherence, protection and promotion of the principles of liberty, equality and fraternity and their associated elements. The contribution of hip-hop towards influencing the engagement of the youth and the society in mainstream politics and towards the advancement of democratic ideals in Tanzania can be highlighted in the scenarios detailed in the following sub-sections.

Commentary on Social, Economic, Cultural and Political Affairs

Freedom of expression is well established as an inherent right in both national and international legal instruments. This is one of the significant principles for development. Since there are different channels of exercising freedom, hip-hop music poses as one of the significant channels of expression. As well accounted for by one of Tanzania's finest music legends – Carola Kinasha – during one of her interviews with Salama Jabir, the significance of this particular art is on its structure, form and content, whereby it allows one to offer different opinions, commentaries, insights and critique on undertaking events and activities.

A hip-hop artist thus poses as a watchdog and a spokesperson of the society; as he or she may use his or her art in fighting corruption, exposing incompetence, promoting accountability and transparency and / or even calling for action. The two iconic singles by Profesa Jay, titled *Nang'atuka* and *Ndio Mzee* well capture this remarkable power of hip-hop, as the respective songs provide astounding and profound criticism of the undertakings of the government and the society at large.

Effective Means of Communication

Since political gatherings are often overwhelmed with political biasness, intellectual/ academic initiatives are highly restricted to a particular set of community grouping; radio and television programmes have strict time limitations and outreach; music however in the alternative poses as an ideal channel of communicating the realities of the communities. The blend of the content and the creativity affirms the effectiveness of the artistry in advocating for democracy and development.

A closer look at songs like *Riziwani (Ridhiwani)* by one of Mbeya Region's finest Izzo Business, and other songs by Tanga Region's remarkable contemporary icons Wagosi wa Kaya – *Umeme na Maji*, *Wauguzi* and *Trafiki*, can surely showcase how hip-hop in particular and music in general are effective and significant in airing out views and concerns of the public. In the first song, the artist dedicated the song to one of the president's sons (as of then), whereas he informs him of the realities and hardships of Tanzanians and asks him to communicate the same message to his father – the president – and altogether rectify the situation. As for the latter set of songs, the artists, famously known for their sarcastic style of rap, magnificently used the same to address corruption of the traffic police force, poor service of the health sector and the decay of water and electricity services.

Political Education

Amongst others, art, in general, is highly reckoned for its role of disseminating knowledge and information; and hip-hop specifically is often associated with building and raising political consciousness. Whereas politicians are beneficiaries of political ignorance of the public, hip-hop however has emerged as a force which strongly contests the imposed, unsound and insignificant political stances and narratives portrayed and advocated for by politicians and government officials.

It is hip-hop which has highly offered counter narratives and has altogether taken the task of liberating the minds of the public. It is subsequent to the improved public awareness on social, economic, political and cultural aspects, contributed by hip-hop's political education that the public has risen to the occasion in demanding accountability in different aspects.

Songs like *Jukumu Letu* by Profesa Jay and Mwana FA and *Nauza Kura Yangu* by Bonta Conscious have been instrumental in stressing on the need for engagement of youth and the public at large in the democratic election, decision making process and even in the building of the nation's economy. Another recently released song by the ever-vocal hip-hop activist Roma, titled *Nipeni Maua Yangu*, also ventures to educate the public on the need to engage in the debate about the need to revise the constitution. The lyrics in the respective hip-hop songs are intended to trigger and awaken the public to engage and take part in different national debates, discussions and actions.

<p>Original Song Jukumu Letu – Profesa Jay & Mwana FA</p> <p><i>Ni jukumu letu/ wananchi wote wewe na mimi/ na maoni yetu/ yawezayo kupunguza umasikini/ kwa taifa letu/ hivyo yatupasa kuwa makini ni jinsi gani tutaweza kuongeza kipato nchini/</i></p>	<p>Translation Our Task – Professor Jay & Mwana FA</p> <p>It is our responsibility/ all citizens, you and I/ And [its] our contributions/ which can reduce our poverty/ To our nation/ hence we need to be thoughtful about how we can improve our economy/</p>
<p>Original Song Nipeni Maua Yangu – ROMA ft. Abiudi</p> <p><i>Nawashangaa vijana warembo na watanashati na nusu/ Wanaosema bila mrengo eti siasa haiwahusu/ Mwanasiasa anaweza amua tu na ukalala mahabusu/ Mnakosea wadogo zangu na kamwe sitoruhusu/ Siasa ndo inaamua sukari iuzwe shingapi/ Na inapanga Kaliua ni wapi wajenge zahanati/ Na ijue tofauti ya mwanasiasa [na] mwanaharakati/ Mmoja ndo mzalendo mwingine maslahi binafsi/ Ntawafundisha kitu kabla hajawika jogoo alfajiri/ Pesa unayonunua mafuta mkate unaolipa bili/ Kodi yake inamlipa Raisi Polisi Mbunge Waziri/ So una haki ya kuwakosoa maana we ndo umewaaaajiri/ Tatizo hatuna ujasiri na akili tumekaza fuvu/</i></p>	<p>Translation Give me my flowers – ROMA ft. Abiudi</p> <p>I am amazed by beautiful and handsome youth/ Who say without knowing that politics is not of their concern/ A politician can just decide that you be locked in custody/ You are wrong my colleagues and surely, I won't allow that/ It is politics which decides the price of sugar / And it plans where in Kaliua should a dispensary be built/ You need to know the difference between a politician [and] an activist/ One is patriotic and the other has self-interests/ I will teach you something before the cock crows/ The money you spend on oil, bread and pay bills/ Its tax pays the President, Police, MP, Minister/ So, you have the right to criticize them as you are the one who has employed them/ The problem is that we are not confident and we have frozen our minds/ thoughts.</p>

Tool for Hope, Encouragement and Agitation

As the late revolutionary leader of South Africa, Nelson Mandela, connotes, it is a “Long Walk to Freedom” (Mandela, 1995), as such a journey is often filled with the sense of discouragement and despair. Often times, the protagonists experience defeat and failure, in their battle against the predominant antagonistic forces. It is also unfortunately the case that the act of speaking the truth to power bears within it high risks and serious consequences. Since the quest for democracy and development provides for another form of battle against power, as it challenges the status quo, this quest is also posed with numerous threats.

Once again, in these difficult circumstances, hip-hop tends to provide hope in despair and altogether offer motivation and encouragement to those with low mood. This particular function of hip-hop is crucial towards the realization of democracy, since often times, the state uses its state apparatuses to suppress the dissenting voices; hence, the presence of different hip-hop songs tend to agitate the public to keep up and further their demands for justice, democracy and development.

Different songs by Roma such as Mathematics, Viva Roma and Tanzania and others by Nay wa Mitego such as *Alisema*, have been so instrumental towards creating and boosting the sense of courage amongst the public to engage in politics. The respective songs not only inspire them to take actions and be on the frontline to condemn wrongdoings but also it encourages the public to rise above the fear of death, detention and all sought of intimidation and humiliation.

Original Song	Translation
Mathematics – ROMA <i>Mwambieni hatukuogopa tabiri za Sheikh Yahaya/ Mauti yangetufika bila kumpinga Jakaya/ Sisaliti sirudishi kadi ya chama kama Nakaaya/</i>	Mathematics - ROMA Tell him that we were not intimidated by the prophecy of Sheikh Yahaya/ We would have died without critiquing Jakaya/ I won't betray and return my card like Nakaaya/
Tanzania – ROMA <i>Nidhamu ya woga sipendi kuipalilia/ Siwezi kufumbia macho dhambi nazo shuhudia/ Najua msema kweli hufa mapema sijali/ Kama mlimuua Amina hapa kwangu chuma cha reli/</i>	Tanzania – ROMA I don't like to nurture hypocritical behaviour/ I cannot turn a blind eye to the sins I am witnessing/ I know he who speaks the truth is bound to die early, I don't care/ If you killed Amina, I am a force to reckon with/
Viva Roma – ROMA <i>Kadi chama nachana nanyongea ganja navuta/ nikamateni si mlimshindwa Tibaijuka/ Leta defenda, leta wajeda, leta wagambo Roma nimejitoa sadaka/ Na mkitaka kuniua hiki kichwa sifii hapa/ Nichinjeni mkanitupe kwenye daraja la Mkapa/</i>	Viva Roma – ROMA I'm tearing the party card and rolling it to smoke weed/ Arrest me, you failed to do so to Tibaijuka/ Bring the defenders, bring the army, bring the police, Roma I have sacrificed myself/ If you want to kill, I am not going to die here/ You better slaughter me and dump me at Mkapa bridge/

Limitations of the Hip-Hop in Mainstream Politics

Together with its admirable and formidable traits, this music genre, in its mainstream capacity, is also faced with significant challenges restricting its ability to realize its utmost prospects and potentials. As a result of these limitation, the power, force, drive and overall relevance of hip-hop towards promoting democratic ideals and development fades and weakens with due time. Amongst others, the respective limitations can be traced on the following account.

Commercialization of Hip-Hop Music

Even though hip-hop peaked at the moment when neoliberalism was gaining pace, the two however did not sync, as hip-hop highly posed a major bottleneck towards the neo-liberal policies. With due time however, the neo-liberal policies of market economy have gained massive ground and have substantially hijacked the hip-hop genre, as it has highly diluted the ‘radical’ elements of the art and in the alternative, it has channeled the artists into the concentrated trap of the commercial agenda.

The commercialization of the genre has posed massive challenges towards the democratic principles and the push for development. Artists, in their numbers, have deviated from accounting on the realities of their respective communities and instead they have concentrated their art in the idolization of wealth. In simple terms, artists have become captives of the market, they have also become detached from the actual realities, as they often tend to dwell on the hallucinations and fantasies of fame, glitz and glamour. Since hip-hop informed, motivated and agitated the mass, its neutralization poses a significant vacuum which places the public in limbo and sends them into a state of trance.

The Messiah-tic Component

The likes of Roma, Nay wa Mitego, Nikki Mbishi, Kala Jeremiah and even Nakaaya have at certain times in their music career, enjoyed the label of being the flag-bearers of the people’s agenda. Such a label and status has been highly championed and celebrated within the mainstream context, which is famously recognized for its branding component. Herein, the artist is pinpointed and highlighted as the messiah and the audience/ mass as the followers. The same can be perfectly depicted in the recent song by Roma (who is in the US as a political exile) – *Nipeni Maua Yangu*.

Original Version	Translation
<u>Nipeni Maua Yangu (Roma Mkatoliki ft Abiud)</u>	<u>Gave Me My Flowers (Roma Mkatoliki ft Abiud)</u>
Kiitikio	Chorus
<i>Tunakupenda Roma Tunakumiss Roma</i>	We love you Roma, We miss you Roma
<i>Rudi Nyumbani Roma Utusemee</i>	Come back home Roma to Speak on our behalf
<i>Tunakupenda Baba Tunakumiss Mwana</i>	We love you Dear, We miss you friend
<i>Tunakukumbuka sana</i>	We remember you a lot

Such a relationship is however very detrimental as the public tends to become very vulnerable and dependable towards the artist. This may halt the process and actions for democracy where and when the “messiah artist” is either co-opted or neutralized by the state, as often is the case, and the public would tend to be *hypnotized* or rather feel *impotent*. The reception of the recent release of the song

Nipeni Maua Yangu, by ROMA, clearly accounts for this. It is exhibited that the public laid its fate on ROMA, and hence when he is silenced or harmed, so too does the general society become harmed and silenced. The attitude of mainstream music to individualize rather than socialize the struggle for democracy altogether places the movement and struggle for democracy, change and development in jeopardy.

Reactionary Confrontation

As Steve Biko, in his celebrated book “*I write what I like*” (Biko, 1979), insists that the principles of democracy ought to be entrenched into the feedback system, hip-hop indeed entails to form part of the feedback system where it represents the perceptions of the public – the beneficiaries of policies – to the actual policy makers. The actual songs which ought to communicate the perceptions of the public, however unfortunately tend to be influenced by trending topics and agenda. This tends to often overwhelm the artist and restrict him/her from providing proper analysis and account of the situation.

Moreover, subject to the existing context, the respective reactionary song would surely be celebrated but its lifespan would be short-lived. This is also probably attributed by the fact that there would be no other associated initiatives to further attend to the respective matter. Songs such as *Miss Tanzania* and *Natoka Tanzania* by Solo Thang and Nikki Mbishi can further account to this, as they radically expose the ills and wrongdoings of the government, but that efforts stop short of results. The struggle has not changed or spared the Tanzanian community from its misery and atrocities of poverty, hunger, corruption and the like.

Concluding Remarks

The existing shortfalls of the hip-hop genre should not in any way frustrate our attention and focus of embracing this powerful weapon in our struggle and course towards democracy. The successes and prospects of this artistic form largely outweigh its limitations. The likes of Profesa Jay, Mwana FA, Nikki wa Pili and Mr. II Sugu gracing and shining in the mainstream political arena should definitely prove to us that hip-hop promises us with far better rewards.

Also, although hip-hop is still highly political, it still enjoys its non-alliance allegiance in politics; this definitely proves its stronghold character and altogether provides for its greatest strength. A vivid account regarding Mwana FA and Nikki wa Pili who are members of the ruling party CCM and Profesa Jay and Mr. II Sugu who are members of the main opposition party CHADEMA, show that they still do not maintain the status of their parties within their artistic positions.

However, it is most important to note that hip-hop is not a sole and independent tool or weapon that could be used in isolation. As the respective genre has influenced other forms of expression, there should be established a concrete political programme and plan of action which would incorporate different forms of expressions and synergize the respective initiatives in the advocacy of democracy and development. It is only upon the synchronization of the hip-hop platform with other political, social and cultural platforms, programmes and endeavors that we can have a formidable people’s movement and eventually realize the genuine democracy and inclusive development.

References

- Amin, S. (2011). The democratic fraud and the universalist alternative. *Monthly Review*, 63(5). <https://monthlyreview.org/2011/10/01/thedemocratic-fraud-and-the-universalist-alternative/>
- Biko, S. (1979). *I Write What I Like*. Johannesburg: Heinemann.
- Fenn, J. and Perullo, A. (2008). Language choices and hip hop in Tanzania and Malawi. *Popular Music and Society*, 24(3):73-93.
- Hanzi, M. (2015). *Chuo kikuu cha hip hop: A positive theory for the negative minded*. Dar es Salaam: Ubunifu Wetu Printing Press.
- Ilado, L. (2017). Activism: Singing for change. *The Elephant*. <https://www.theelephant.info/radio/2017/12/08/activism-singing-for-change/> (Accessed on 20th October 2023).
- Jilala, H. (2013). Muziki wa hip hop na haki za kijamii: Dhima, changamoto na mapendekezo. Kitivo cha Sayansi na Sanaa za Jamii, Chuo Kikuu Huria cha Tanzania (Open University of Tanzania).
- Mandela, N. (1995). *Long Walk to Freedom*. London: Abacus.
- Marques, L. (2023). Hip hop and the conditions that gave rise to a cultural movement, *Peoples Dispatch*, <https://peoplesdispatch.org/2023/08/11/hip-hop-and-the-conditions-that-gave-rise-to-a-cultural-movement/> (accessed on 21st October 2023).
- Rodney, W. (1973). *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*. London: Bogle-L'Ouverture Publications and Dar es Salaam: Tanzanian Publishing House.
- Stroeken, K. (2005). Immunizing strategies: Hip-hop and critique in Tanzania, Africa. *Journal of the International African Institute*, 75(4): 488-509.

Parliamentary Broadcasting in Tanzania: A Fallen Tree Without Sound

Samwilu Mwaffisi¹

Abstract

Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation (TBC) started broadcasting live parliamentary debates in 2015 except for the deliberations of the parliamentary standing communities. However, the government banned live broadcasts of parliamentary debates for both radio and television effective the 2016/17 budget session. Instead, a new system of media parliamentary reporting was introduced. This study assessed the impact of the ban on parliamentary news reporting. The study used a mixed research design. A questionnaire was sent to 300 respondents while 30 key informants were interviewed. Purposive and Convenience sampling techniques were used to sample the population. Quantitative data were analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) while qualitative data were analyzed manually thematically according to the three research-specific objectives. Research findings showed that 88% of the respondents agreed that the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts undermined the budding democracy in the country while 90% said the ban violated the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania and 86% said the ban infringed on the rights of journalists to inform the public and denied their right to information. The study concluded that the ban did not ban journalists from reporting parliamentary debates because they were allowed to sit in the parliament and cover all the parliamentary debates and report them to the public provided in doing so they did not violate regulations that govern parliamentary proceedings.

Keywords: Parliament, broadcasting, democracy, constitution.

Introduction

TBC is a merger between Radio Tanzania Dar es Salaam (RTD) and *Televisheni ya Taifa* (national television) - TVT that were established in 1965 and 1998 respectively. RTD was established following the nationalization of the colonial Tanganyika Broadcasting Corporation modelled on the BBC (Mytton, 1983). After the nationalization, RTD was made a fully-fledged department of the Ministry of Information, Broadcasting and Tourism (Mwaffisi, 2013). RTD remained a government department until 2004 when it merged with TVT to become a public corporation named Tanzania Broadcasting Services (TBS) but was popularly known by its Kiswahili short form TUT (Taasisi ya Utangazaji Tanzania). TUT was renamed Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation (TBC) in 2008. Throughout its life span, RTD never broadcasted parliamentary proceedings live except the annual budget speeches of the Minister for Finance and speeches of the President when he addressed the parliament or the nation on issues of great national importance. However, it used segments of the parliamentary proceedings in its heavily edited programme “*Leo Katika Bunge*” (Today in Parliament) and other programmes such as the news bulletins, current affairs programme (*MAJIRA*) and radio magazine programmes, among others. Initially, TVT did not broadcast live parliamentary proceedings instead it transported tapes from the parliament in Dodoma to the broadcasting house in Dar es Salaam for broadcasting segments in the news bulletins and other current affairs programmes.

TBC started broadcasting live parliamentary proceedings in 2005. Public service broadcasting is the most suitable service for parliamentary broadcasting (Banda, 2001) and making the political process

¹ Lecturer, Dar es Salaam Tumaini University. Email: gerezanorthta@gmail.com

transparent is a prime undertaking of any public broadcaster (Benerjee and Senerante, 2005). Parliaments are open to the public so that they may see what is being enacted in their name (Smith, 2003) and therefore widen the opportunities for democratic participation in decision-making (Krogh, 2003).

However, the Government banned the live broadcast of parliamentary proceedings for both radio and television effective the 2016/17 budget session which started in March 2016. Only the questions-and-answers sessions were broadcast live. Kassim Majaliwa, the Prime Minister said the decision was made in good faith to save costs. The then Minister for Information, Culture, Arts and Sports, Nape Nnauye said it cost TBC 4.2 Billion Tanzania shillings annually to broadcast live parliamentary proceedings, an amount the Minister said was too high given the move by the fifth phase administration of President John Pombe Magufuli to cut cost. Instead, a new system of media parliamentary reporting was introduced effective 2016/17 budget session. According to the new system radio and television stations wanting to broadcast live parliamentary proceedings had to hook frequencies of the parliament which doctored information before circulating the same to other media outlets.

Statement of the Problem

Live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings enhance democracy in a democratic society because they allow constituents to become part of the discussion going on in the parliament and provide them with an opportunity to appraise the conduct of their elected representatives. Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation started live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings in 2005. Before that private radio and television stations provided live broadcasts. However, the government banned live parliamentary broadcasts effective March 2016 except for questions-and-answers sessions.

Objectives of the study

The main objective of this study was to assess the impact of the ban on live parliamentary broadcasting on parliamentary news reporting. The specific objectives of the study were to:

1. Examine whether the ban on live coverage of parliamentary proceedings by radio and television undermined the budding democracy in Tanzania;
2. Determine whether the new system of covering the parliament was a violation of the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania; and
3. Determine whether the ban on live parliamentary broadcasting infringed the right of journalists to inform the public about parliamentary news.

Literature review

The significance of live parliamentary broadcasts cannot be over-emphasized here. Suffice it to say that many scholars of journalism and mass communication have attested to its prominence in a democratic society. In countries where public service broadcasting is biased against opposition political parties, live parliamentary broadcasts serve an important role in keeping the electorate informed of what their elected representatives are discussing and planning in their name (Zambia Cabinet Handbook, 1996).

Therefore, live parliamentary broadcasts ensure the right of the people to receive a diversity of viewpoints on important political issues (Krogh, 2003). Many parliaments work to open themselves to greater involvement by individuals and organizations that have contributed to their work and want

the people to be better informed about what the parliament is doing (Johnson, 2006). Consequently, parliamentarians are keen to have their proceedings broadcast to a wider audience (Johnson, *ibid*).

Although parliaments are open to the public so that they see what is being enacted in their name, limited space in the public galleries makes it impossible for all the people to sit there (Smith, 2003). Therefore, Smith believes that one way that the parliament proceedings can be brought into every home is through live parliamentary broadcasting. Hence, live parliamentary broadcasts extend parliamentary debates into the public domain (Banda, 2001) and give people a ticket to the place in which public debate takes place which were hitherto closed to them (Elkabbach, 2006). If we want to be part of modern society, we need to use every means available to open up parliament to the public (Lindberg, 2006).

Live parliamentary broadcasts enable citizens to listen and watch as their representatives make decisions which directly affect their lives hence people today are better able to assess for themselves the performance of their elected representatives (Marshall, 2003). Live parliamentary broadcasts are key to democracy and the full exercise of citizens' rights (Poreacchia, 2006). It is important to use parliamentary broadcasts as a means of engaging in a dialogue with people to enhance their understanding of how the parliament works (Poreacchia, *ibid*). They also open the parliamentary to the people, keep an eye on the government and open politics in a country hence any country that wants to have an open system of government has to go public with its government functions and one way of doing it is through live parliamentary broadcasts (Lamb, 2006). Live parliamentary broadcasts also create a direct link between citizens and media, it closes the gap between citizens and parliament because there is a need for citizens to be informed and for the parliament to reach out to the people (Fichtelius, 2006).

However, the institutionalization of the parliament has reduced the August House into a club of elected officials, effectively closed off from public scrutiny (Banda, *ibid*). This prompted an unnamed philosopher to ask "If a tree falls in a forest and there is no one to hear it, does it make a sound?" According to the philosopher, the answer is "NO" "because if a parliament holds a debate and nobody hears it, then the debate has no effect because the parliament needs an audience and in this digital age the mass media is the link between parliament and the citizens who are audience.

Knowledge Gap

Tanzania follows the Commonwealth parliamentary system. Literature abounds about the Commonwealth parliamentary system. However, the literature on live parliamentary broadcasting is very scanty. There are papers online about parliamentary broadcasting based on conference presentations. For example; *The Challenges of Broadcasting Parliamentary Proceedings* and *Public Broadcasting System* were papers that were presented at a conference on "Broadcasting Parliament Business Through Dedicated Television Channels" that was held in Geneva on October 19, 2006. *Parliamentary Broadcasting in Zambia: Towards Alternative Public Service Broadcasting* was a paper that Fackson Banda presented at a conference in Kampala in 2001. An interactive multi-media discussion session titled *Broadcasting Parliament* was held in Vietnam on February 20, 2004. The Commonwealth Broadcasting Association in collaboration with UNESCO published a survey across all the commonwealth countries that is titled: *Informed Democracies: Parliamentary Broadcasts as a Public Service*. Therefore, this study will add knowledge to the scanty literature available on parliamentary broadcasts from the perspective of a developing country purporting to build a democratic society.

Research Methodology

Research Design

This study used a mixed research design, A questionnaire was sent to respondents while key informants were interviewed.

Area of Study

This study was conducted in the Ilala, Kinondoni and Temeke districts that together made up the Dar es Salaam region. The population of Dar es Salaam was 4,364,541 inhabitants (NBS, 2012). The region has a total surface area of 1800 sqkm and has both regional and city council administrations headed by a Regional Commissioner and mayors respectively. Although in 1974 the government decided to shift the capital city to Dodoma, Dar es Salaam remains the major and commercial city of Tanzania.

Population

The population of this study included electorates and key informants included radio and television journalists who cover the parliament regularly including Members of Parliament, lawyers and officials from the parliament. Radio and television journalists covering the parliament regularly were selected because of their experience and knowledge of parliament news reporting. Electorates were selected because they have vested interests in their MPs hence their opinion on the research was very pertinent, Members of Parliament were selected because they were directly affected by the ban and are also lawmakers. Officials of the parliament were necessary for clarifying matters arising from the debate and on parliamentary rules and regulations, particularly on the ban. Lawyers were included to provide legal opinions on issues raised in the study.

Sample Size and Sampling Techniques

The sample for the quantitative survey was 300 respondents, 100 from each of the three districts of Dar es Salaam. The sample for the qualitative study was 30 key informants which included 10 members of Parliament divided equally between the ruling party and opposition parties, 5 radio journalists and 5 television journalists from both state-owned and privately owned broadcasting outlets, 5 journalists from print media, 3 lawyers including a state attorney and two parliamentary officials.. All 300 respondents were sampled using the convenience sampling technique while the 30 key informants were sampled using the purposive sampling technique.

Data Collection Techniques

Both secondary and primary data collection methods were used to collect data for the study. Secondary data are those which have been collected and analyzed by someone else and primary data are those which were collected afresh and for the first time hence they are original (Kumar, 2005). A questionnaire was used to collect data from the 300 respondents. Out of the 300 copies of the questionnaire that were distributed, 280 (93%) were returned. Out of the returned copies, 93(33%), 94(34%) and 93(33%) were from Kinondoni, Ilala and Temeke districts respectively. A questionnaire is the most concise and pre-planned set of questions designed to yield specific information about a particular topic (Kothari, 2005). Structured interviews were used to solicit information from the key informants. Structured interviews involved the use of a set of predetermined questions and the interview followed a rigid laid-down procedure of asking questions in the form and order prescribed. Documentary review was used to collect secondary data from journals, published, and unpublished, books, and papers.

Data Analysis

Quantitative data were analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) and qualitative data obtained from the unstructured interviews were analyzed manually after being clustered into the three research objectives and were analyzed thematically.

Findings

Undermining budding democracy in Tanzania

The research showed that 88% of the respondents agreed that the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts undermined the budding democracy in the country while 9% of the respondents said the ban did not undermine the budding democracy and 3% of the respondents were not sure whether the ban undermined the budding democracy.

Table 1: Undermining Budding Democracy

DISTRICTS	YES (%)	NO (%)	NOT SURE (%)
Kinondoni	87.1	11.8	1.1
Ilala	88.3	7.4	4.3
Temeke	89.2	7.5	3.2
TOTAL	88.3	8.9	2.9

Source: Field Data, 2019

A key informant who is a senior journalist contended that live coverage of parliamentary proceedings makes a positive contribution to achieving greater transparency and openness to matters about the August House. He explained that live broadcasts make the political process in the country transparent and that transparency is one of the very important elements of a democratic society. Another key informant who is a broadcaster with TBC argued that although live parliamentary broadcasts stimulated and inspired public debates among the citizens, the ban was necessary because MPs from the opposition camp used abusive language which could not be aired live on both cultural and professional ethical grounds. He was supported by an MP from the ruling party who said that some MPs from the opposition misbehaved before the cameras because they wanted to show off to their electorates who were watching them.

However, MPs from the opposition had a different opinion about the ban. One of the special seats member argued that the government wrongly believed that the live parliamentary broadcasts were strengthening the opposition in the country hence the ban was an ill motive on the part of the government to stop the opposition from giving their critical and candid views on the poor performance of the government. Her opinion was supported by another opposition MP who argued that the ban was a deliberate attempt by the government to silence the voice of the opposition to weaken the opposition.

A key informant who identified himself as a member of the major opposition party in the country noted that live parliamentary broadcasts gained popularity because opposition MPs used the broadcasts to expose the weaknesses of the government. A CCM member of parliament from Zanzibar supported the ban except when the House discusses national security which he termed

“confidential and sensitive matters”. However, his party colleague fully supported the ban because he said many people waste their productive time watching the live broadcastings contrary to the clarion call of the fifth phase government of *Hapa Kazi Tu*.

Most of the key informants who opposed the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts argued that it denied the people their right to receive a diversity of views on important national issues that would have enabled them to make informed decisions. One key informant admitted that live parliamentary broadcasts stimulated useful public debates which are important in a democratic society. Another key informant said the live broadcasts enabled development stakeholders to make a follow-up on what was discussed in the parliament and hence be able to take part in the debate for or against issues raised because free debates are the cornerstone of a democratic society.

It was also argued that the live parliamentary broadcast made the people knowledgeable about the activities of the parliament and those of their representatives when they were inside the parliament. One key informant said that live broadcasting stimulated public interest in and knowledge about their MPs and their works while another one said the live broadcasts raised awareness of the daily activities of the MPs and convinced the public that the August House raises issues of concern to the public. A key informant who is a lawyer said the live parliamentary broadcasts offered the public an opportunity to observe legislators at work and foster increased public involvement and participation in the law-making process thus strengthening the democratic system in the country.

Violation of the Constitution

Article 18 of the 1977 Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania states: *“Everyone is free to express any opinion, to reveal his views and seek, receive and disseminate any information and ideas through any medium regardless of the country’s frontiers”*. Most of the informants who said the ban violated the Constitution based their arguments on this section of the Constitution. The research findings also showed that 90% of all the respondents said the ban violated the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania 9% said it did not and one percent were not sure.

Table 2: Violation of the Constitution

DISTRICTS	YES (%)	NO (%)	NOT SURE (%)
Kinondoni	90.3	8.6	1.1
Ilala	87.2	11.7	1.1
Temeke	92.5	6.5	1.1
TOTAL	90.0	8.9	1.1

Source: Field Data, 2019

A key informant contended that since receiving information is a constitutional right, the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts was a violation of the Constitution. However, he added that violation of the constitution is another thing and taking action to demand that right is another thing. He argued that since no single individual or institution has gone to court to demand that right, the situation remains the same. He urged Tanzanians to make use of the courts to fight for their right to information including the right to receive parliamentary information which is guaranteed not only in the constitution but also in the Access to Information Act 2016.

A key informant who is an advocate pointed out that not only did the ban violate the 1977 Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania but also Article 19 of the United National Declaration of Human Rights and Article 9 (1) of the African Charter on Human Rights and Peoples' Right to which the United Republic of Tanzania is a signatory. He argued that both Articles give the people of Tanzania the right to receive information hence the ban also violated these international protocols. A CHADEMA member of parliament argued that the ban "abrogated" Article 18 of the constitution. Another CHADEMA MP pointed out that the ban was a vivid example of how the government has been breaking the laws of this country including the constitution which gives the citizen the right to information.

However, a former cabinet minister who is also a lawyer refuted claims that the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts amounted to a violation of Article 18 of the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania. He argued that there was nowhere in the supreme law the right to live coverage of parliamentary debates was granted hence he insisted that the ban should be expected because there was no absolute right to freedom. Sentiments of the former cabinet minister were supported by a CCM MP who stated that the right to information is not absolute. A key informant who is a State Attorney argued that the Constitution also required that freedom guaranteed in the Constitution should not jeopardize the law of the country. He further pointed out that section 30 (1) of the same constitution limits all rights and freedom guaranteed under the Bill of Rights.

A key informant who is a senior reporter with a privately owned media outlet argued that the ban did not only violate the constitution but also some of the laws of the country. She argued that to ensure that freedom and rights guaranteed under the constitution are enjoyed, laws are enacted for that purpose and she cited the Access to Information Act of 2016 as an example. She argued, therefore that the ban was a violation of this law. However, a key informant who is a senior editor with a state-owned newspaper argued that freedom to receive information is not absolute because no country in the world, be it developed or developing allows its mass media to roam at will entirely free to disseminate to people information they choose.

Infringe right of journalists to inform the public

Journalists in a democratic country have a very important duty to provide their citizens with information that empowers them to work hard to achieve the cherished goals that they have set for themselves. Journalists also must promote democracy in their own country when allowed to publish information to that effect without being oppressed or intimidated by the powers that be. For democracy to flourish in a country with a budding democracy, journalists must be free to report without fear or favour but within the law of the country in which they work. Therefore, the third specific objective of the study was to determine whether the ban on live broadcasts of the parliamentary proceedings infringed on the right of journalists to practice their journalism duties of providing the public with news from the parliament.

According to the research findings, 86% of the respondents said the ban on live parliamentary broadcasts infringed the right of journalists to inform the public about parliamentary news while 11% said it did not and 3% were not sure.

Table 3: Infringe right of journalists to inform the public

DISTRICTS	YES (%)	NO (%)	NOT SURE (%)
Kinondoni	83.9	11.8	4.3
Ilala	83.0	16.0	1.1
Temeke	91.4	5.4	3.2
TOTAL	86.1	11.1	2.9

Source: Field Data, 2019

A key informant who works with a private FM broadcasting station in Dar es Salaam said that the live broadcast of parliamentary proceedings enabled a media outlet that could not afford to send reporters to the parliament in Dodoma to hook the live broadcasts of TBC and use them to make their own editorial decision on what was news for them that they would like to give their target audience. A key informant who is a retired senior journalist from Tanzania Information Service (*Maelezo*) argued that in a democratic society, journalists have the noble duty to inform the public on issues of public interest hence making the political process transparent. However, he believed that the ban denied journalists in the country the right to choose the right angle that they believed was newsworthy instead they have been forced to take angles dictated by the communication unit of the parliament. His argument was supported by another key informant who said the personnel in the communication unit recorded the proceedings and gave journalists heavily edited clips of the proceedings. He opined that in this case, the journalists have no choice but to take the angle of the doctored clips.

A key informant who is a senior broadcaster with TBC lamented that the qualities of the clips provided were very inferior because most of the personnel in the communication unit of the parliament are neither skilled journalists nor experts in video editing. However, one of the officials from the parliament refuted this claim insisting that personnel in their communication unit were competent and experienced journalists. He argued that the parliament fosters cooperation with journalists reporting on the parliament to create a link with the people hence informing them about the works of the parliament with the hope of encouraging greater understanding of the parliament and its activities.

An MP from the opposition said that MPs from the ruling party and the government would like to suppress certain information that they do to want to reach the public. He argued that the live broadcasts were useful news tips for serious investigative journalists because there were issues raised especially by opposition MPs that needed a follow-up. He acknowledged that experience has proved that journalists who investigated issues that started as tips in the parliament enabled them to expose high-level grand corruption and culprits were made accountable. Another senior reporter with a private media in Dar es Salaam agreed that the clips were good news tips which journalists can follow up with opposition MPs or what he called “controversial and outspoken” MPs from the ruling party for details that would enable them to write good informative parliamentary news stories.

A senior editor who once served as chief executive officer of a state-owned media outlet believed that the ban did not infringe on the right of journalists to carry out their professional duties. He argued that journalists were never barred from reporting parliamentary proceedings because they were free to cover all the activities of the parliament and report them provided in doing so they did not go

against regulations that govern parliamentary proceedings. It was his opinion that since journalists were allowed to stay in parliament throughout the sessions it was prudent for them to make proper recording of the proceedings which they can broadcast and publish as and when they deem appropriate. His argument was supported by another key informant who works for a private mainstream broadcasting house who agreed that since journalists are allowed to sit throughout the parliamentary sessions therefore competent journalists should be able to take major newsworthy points and write good parliamentary news stories.

Discussion

For democracy to thrive in an emerging democratic country like Tanzania, its citizens must be informed on issues of national interest so that they can make informed decisions. Live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings provide the people with analysis, discussion, and debates on issues of national interest hence inspiring and instigating public debates on the issues. Therefore, to discuss whether the ban undermined the budding democracy in Tanzania, it is important to look at two elements, among others, of very important elements of a democratic country. The elements are transparency and free discussion. Live broadcasts help to achieve greater transparency of the parliamentary proceedings and stimulate public debates on issues raised in the August House. Journalists were not barred inside the parliament. They were free to sit in the House throughout its sessions, freely taking notes of what was being said and allowed to report whatever they had gathered as long as they did not violate the rules and regulations of the parliament. On receiving such parliamentary news, the people were free to discuss and analyse issues presented to them through mass media. Therefore, the banning of live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings did not make the parliament a closed House because journalists facilitated the transference of information and the people freely discussed publicly issues raised in Parliament.

Although Article 18 of the 1977 Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania and The Access to Information Act of 2015 give the people the right to receive information, the right to receive information, like other rights, is not absolute. Section 18 (1) of the same Constitution states: without jeopardizing the law of the country, every citizen has the right to be informed about various events in the country and around the world. Section 30 (i) of the same Constitution also limits all rights and freedom guaranteed under the Bill of Rights. Limited freedom is not unique to Tanzania only. Even international protocols limit it. For example, UN Resolution 59 (1) adopted during the first session of the UN General Assembly on December 14, 1946 states: “the exercise of freedom should be done without abuse and should seek facts without prejudice and spread knowledge without malicious intent.” Article 27 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights provides restrictions on freedom to receive and impart information by requiring individuals to exercise protected freedom concerning the rights of others, collective security, morality and common interests. Hopkins (1971), contended that no society allows its mass media to roam at will entirely free to disseminate to the mass audience all events and thoughts they choose.

Therefore, although the ban on live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings may have appeared to many people as a violation of the constitution, it was simply a limitation of the freedom as guaranteed by the same Constitution and other international protocols to which Tanzania is a signatory. People who argue the ban is a violation of the Constitution read Article 18 in isolation. They should also read Sections 18 (1) and 30 (1).

The ban did not infringe on the right of journalists to do their duty of informing the public about news from the parliament because journalists were free to sit throughout the parliamentary sessions, freely

taking notes on whatever was said and happened inside the parliament and report to the public as long they did not infringe parliamentary rules and regulations. The ban indeed took the country one step backwards to when parliamentary broadcasts were not live. During this time, just like during the ban, journalists were allowed to sit throughout the parliamentary sessions and report freely as long as they did not violate parliamentary rules and regulations. The digital generation of journalists needs to be creative and enterprising with their parliamentary news sources to have diversified parliamentary news.

Conclusion

While it is true the ban might have reduced enthusiasm among the people to watch television and listen to the radio when the parliamentary sessions were on, there was no proof that their enthusiasm to discuss issues of national interests raised in the parliament declined following the ban. The cornerstone of democracy is for the people to have the freedom to discuss freely issues of public concern originating from the parliament.

It is true that at first glance the ban might seem to have violated the constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania, especially Article 18 when it is read in isolation. However, it is an undeniable fact that freedom is never absolute, hence different nations enact legislations to limit freedom in what has always been referred to as ‘national interest’ or ‘national security.’ The ban on live broadcasts of parliamentary proceedings did not bar journalists from reporting the proceedings because they were free to cover all the activities of the parliament and report them provided in doing so they did not violate regulations that govern parliamentary proceedings. Since journalists were allowed to stay in parliament throughout the sessions, it was prudent for them to make proper recordings of the proceedings which they could broadcast and publish as and when they felt appropriate. That is how the parliament was being covered for years before live broadcasts were allowed. Therefore, journalists should not have taken the ban as an excuse for not doing their duty of informing the public on issues from the August House but they should have taken it as a challenge for them to be more enterprising and creative in sourcing parliamentary news.

In order to avoid conflicts between journalists and the legislature with regard to media coverage of the parliament, it is recommended that journalists covering the parliament should strictly adhere to rules and regulations for parliamentary broadcasts as stipulated by the Commonwealth Broadcasting Association.

References

- Banda, F. (2001). *Parliamentary Broadcasting in Zambia: Toward an Alternative Public Services*. Conference paper, Kampala.
- Elkabhach, J. (2006). *President and Manager of France’s Public Senate*. A speech delivered at the conference on *Broadcasting Parliamentary Business through Dedicated Television Channels*, Geneva, on October 19, 2006.
- Fichtelius, E. (2006). “Conclusion” *Executive Producer and Editor of STV24 Direct*, Sweden.
- Hopkins, M. (1970). *Mass Media in the Soviet Union*, Western Publishing Company, New York.

- Johnson, A. (2006). IPU Secretary General, speech delivered on “The Challenges of Broadcasting Parliamentary Proceedings through Dedicated Television Channels,” Geneva, October 19, 2006.
- Kothari, C. (2005). *Research Methodology: Methods and Techniques*. New Delhi, India: News Age International.
- Krogh, T. (2003). “Preface”. In: Raine et al., *Informed Democracies: Parliamentary Broadcasts as a Public Services*, CBA, UNESCO and CPA.
- Kumar, R. (2005). *The Research Methodology: Step-by-step Guide for Beginners*. Australia: Pearson Education Group.
- Lindberg, S. (2006). *Democracy and Elections in Africa*. John Hopkins University Press.
- Marshall, D. (2003). Foreward. In: Raine et al., *Informed Democracies: Parliamentary Broadcasts as a Public Services*.
- Mwaffisi, M. (2013). *Editorial Independence in Public Broadcasters in Africa: Case study of Tanzania Broadcastings Corporation during Multi-party Presidential Elections, 1995 – 2010*, Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Dar es Salaam.
- Mytton, G. (1993). *Communication in Africa*. London: Sage Publisher.
- National Bureau of Statistics – NBS. (2013). *2012 Population and Housing Census: Population Distribution by Administrative Area, Vol. 1*, National Bureau of Statistics, Dar es Salaam.
- Poreacchia, P. (2006). Head of Italian Chamber of Deputies, Communication Office – interview with International Parliamentary Union.
- Smith, E. (2003). “Forward”. In: Raine et al., *Informed Democracies: Parliamentary Broadcasts as a Public Services*, CBA, UNESCO, CPA.
- Zambia Cabinet Handbook, (1996). Zambia Cabinet Office, Lusaka.

Assessment of the effects of 360-degree performance appraisal on employees' performance in private telecommunication companies: A case of Tigo Head Office in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Evaline Jackson Laizer² and Lazaro Swai¹

Abstract

This paper set out to assess, from the perspectives of the employees, the effect of 360-degree performance appraisal on employee performance at Tigo Office in Dar es Salaam. The study used a quantitative research approach within the positivism paradigm. The study used a descriptive research design. Stratified sampling was used to generate a sample size of 83 respondents. Data were collected through a structured questionnaire and were analysed through descriptive statistics with the aid of SPSS version 20. The findings suggest that at Tigo's Head Office, the 360-degree performance appraisal is used to improve employees' performance, identify employees' strengths and weaknesses, identify employees' training needs and address them, foster employees' working morale level, and boost employees' working commitment. The study recommends that for an effective 360-degree performance appraisal, the exercise should be participatory, transparent and well-resourced. Future studies should involve a wider scope of institutions and use a combination of methods.

Keywords: 360-degree Performance Appraisal, Employees Performance, Private Telecommunication Companies, Tigo

Introduction

Employees' performance is a crucial tool that contributes to the growth of an organization or emerging markets because an employee's ability to work as per expectations helps the organization in meeting competitive advantage which leads to its growth. However, for employees to work hard and meet organisational expectations they need to be motivated and their needs met as per their expectations (Ndungu, (2017).

Performance appraisal helps an organization in making sure that all its goals and objectives are achieved as expected. So, the use of performance appraisal cannot be avoided by an organization that wants to strive high (Dangol, 2021). Many private organizations use the 360-degree feedback performance appraisal compared to the public sector which uses Open Performance Review and Appraisal System (OPRAS) to get a detailed review of both employee's and employers' performance, to get an enhanced management style, to provide information which helps counsel subordinates in the organization (Kottathai & Abinaya, 2021). Another study in Nigeria revealed that organizations

² Former MBA Student. Tumaini University Dar es Salaam College, evalinejackson1@gmail.com

¹ Lecturer, Dar es Salaam Tumaini University, Lazaro.swai@tudarco.ac.tz

were affected in terms of productivity and employee working morale which were caused by ineffective performance appraisal strategies (Iyiola et.al, 2020).

In Namibia, Cudjoe (2021) revealed that the performance appraisal system involved participation in determining performance standards and also used multiple methods of performance assessment and feedback gaps. It was also found that the system was useful in promoting employees' effectiveness and efficiency. Moreover, the staff generally held positive perceptions about how performance appraisal is conducted, and how the appraisal process is carried out. They believed that appropriate performance appraisal systems, for example, 360-degree feedback performance appraisal and OPRAS, would help them determine their performance level, strengths and weaknesses, areas where training needs are necessary and increase organizational productivity.

The governments of Tanzania and private telecommunication companies have made efforts to improve the existing appraisal systems and introduce a new one. One of the examples is the use of OPRAS, 360-degree feedback and management by objectives performance appraisal system which aims to foster employee performance through knowing their strengths and weaknesses. In the private sector, organizations and institutions have been using various performance appraisal techniques. Several barriers are hindering effective practices of the performance appraisal in Tanzania as reported by Nchimbi (2019).

Although 360 degrees is believed to be one of the best employee appraisal systems, it may be overwhelming for employees to receive 360-degree feedback from so many different sources, especially if they are sensitive to criticism. As a result, productivity and motivation may suffer. This paper set out to determine and discuss the importance of a 360-degree performance appraisal system in the performance of Tigo employees. The following are descriptions of some of the terminologies used.

- Performance appraisal

Performance appraisal is an essential instrument in any organization that needs to improve employee performance hence increasing organization productivity. This is a system that is used in evaluating employees' level of performance at the workplace. For organizations to achieve their goals and objectives there are important factors that should be considered namely; planning the appraisal process and creating awareness among both subordinates and their supervisors. The success of proper planning of the performance appraisal process brings workforce development and performance development (Wang et al. 2019; Ali et al., 2019). Gupta (2006) defined performance appraisal as the determination and communication with an employee on how he or she is performing the job and establishing a plan of improvement. He further argues that performance appraisal is designed to analyse workers' strengths and weaknesses by comparing performance standards with their outcome or output.

- 360-degree performance appraisal

The 360-degree Feedback is a modern appraisal system where workers get personal, important responses concerning their performance from raters who can be those who work around them such as managers, peers, subordinates, direct reports and external stakeholders. The 360 Feedback can also be used to evaluate the performance of people in the corporate organization (Peng & Zeng, 2017). The 360-degree Feedback is also known as a multi-rater feedback system because it

provides feedback from different sources such as peers, subordinate managers, supervisors and external stakeholders. 360 degrees is not only used as a performance evaluation tool but also helps check employees' behaviour at the workplace and also measures work relationships among employees in the organization (Nugrana et al., 2020).

- Employees' Performance

Employee performance, according to Armstrong and Taylor (2009), is how employees perform their duties and complete the appropriate tasks. This emphasizes both getting tasks done efficiently and following necessary procedures. The way an employee performs or executes his / her duties will determine his value to the organization.

An overview of 360-degree performance appraisal in Tigo Head office

Tigo is among the leading telecommunication companies in Tanzania, which is currently undergoing a significant transformation in human resource management through the implementation of a 360-degree performance appraisal system. This approach allows employees to receive feedback from different angles such as peers, supervisors, and subordinates. Tigo has experienced improvements in employee performance, skills, self-development, and enhanced job satisfaction. Through 360-degree performance appraisal, Tigo fostered a culture of continuous learning and encouraging collaboration with their employees about their performance and professional growth which helped Tigo in maximizing the potential of its workforce and staying ahead in the competitive telecommunication market.

Literature Review

Expectancy Theory

The study was guided by the Expectancy Theory propounded by Vroom (1964). Expectancy theory has some elements of motivation as a combination of expectancy (effort), instrumentality (performance or outcome) and valence (reward). The theory proposes that individuals will choose certain behaviours over others because of what they expect to be the outcome of that specific behaviour. The theory is grounded on the assumption that a worker's effort determines his or her performance and performance will lead to rewards. Employees can either be rewarded positively or negatively but the more positive the rewards are the more likely an employee will be highly motivated, hence performing efficiently and effectively.

The theory was directly related to this research because; it explained what motivates an employee to perform or behave in a certain way. The theory suggested that efforts must be applied by an individual to boost his or her performance which later brings an outcome that needs to be rewarded according to how that individual had performed. So, concerning the study employers must make sure that they introduce performance systems which show the relationship between rewards and performance. Managers also need to make sure that they reward an individual or an employee according to how he or she has performed. Employers also need to make sure that employees are well-trained and insist on the importance of putting more effort into what they are doing.

Empirical literature review

There is no doubt that in the 21st Century, it is clear that mobile companies compete with their rivals through innovative and effective management of their human resources. So many organizations and companies decided to manage their human resources by choosing an appropriate system for performance appraisal. The 360-degree performance appraisal has been used mostly in private organizations for the following reasons: organization growth, promotion, employees' self-awareness, employee potential development, performance improvement and also a competitive advantage (Armstrong, 2009).

Ashwini and Preethab (2017) examined the contribution of 360-degree feedback on employees' engagement by using past literature as a method of data collection. The study also revealed that feedback motivates employees in the workplace and gives them personal satisfaction. Apart from monitoring and evaluating employees and their supervisors' performance, 360-degree feedback is also used in making decisions about pay, promotion and other incentives. Therefore, the authors recommended that organizations should use appropriate 360-degree performance appraisal, which will lead to organisational growth, behavioural change, employee satisfaction and potential growth of employees.

A study conducted by Prasetyaningrum & Setiawan (2020) used a qualitative method with a quantitative approach. The study revealed that 360-degree performance appraisal is used not only for organizational benefit but also for the benefit of a person within an organization. The 360-degree performance appraisal system helps an organization to grow its sales and revenue, making decisions based on pay, rewards, training needs and employees' performances (Society for Human Resource Management, 2023).

Green, et.al. (2019) in their study on crowd-sourced employer reviews and stock returns found that it is important to set performance standards and make employees aware of those standards which will be used in comparing with employee performance when measuring performance. This study also revealed that for an organization to benefit from employee performance after the appraisal is done, necessary actions like rewards, training, promotion, salary increase and career development should be taken. Providing all the necessary actions after evaluation of employees' performance makes employees to be of a greater advantage to the organization by increasing productivity and winning competitive advantage.

A study done in Nigeria by Ajibola, et al. (2019) on performance appraisal and employee engagement used 260 respondents who were selected randomly to answer the questions prepared by the researcher. The study revealed that many manufacturing industries in Nigeria use traditional appraisal systems to improve employees' performance. Those traditional appraisal systems included rating scale appraisal, essay appraisal system, ranking method, and paired comparison method. This means for employees to perform effectively an organization needs to see the importance of making sure that performance appraisal systems are used in measuring employee performance regularly.

A study conducted by Zondo (2018) on the influence of 360-degree performance appraisal on labour productivity revealed that his findings were very different from other researchers most of whom show the only positive side of 360-degree performance appraisal. Zondo (ibid) also showed that 360-degree feedback is an instrument used to identify employees' strengths and weaknesses and training needs.

The results showed that the 360-degree performance appraisal does not only influence labour productivity improvement but also, the relationship between spoilage rate and labour productivity improvement.

Furthermore, organizations expect high productivity and competitive advantage, low labour turnover, high employee working morale, employee commitment at work and also meeting the demands of their stakeholders such as customers and suppliers. So, with 360-degree feedback performance appraisal management is in a good position to meet their expectations such as improving employee performance, high productivity, employees' self-awareness, identification of training needs, customer satisfaction and employee commitment (Mukhopadhyay, 2016).

Methodology

The study applied a quantitative research approach using a descriptive design which facilitated efficient data collection within a large population in a shorter period. The design was also selected because it gives an accurate depiction of what is happening at a particular period. The study employed stratified random sampling and simple random sampling in selecting respondents from all departments, where the total population was divided into two strata; operational and administrative strata and after grouping employees into their strata, then the researcher randomly distributed the questionnaires. This made sure that there was an equal chance of being selected for Tigo's head office. The study had a sample size of 83 respondents from a total population of 105 employees in Tigo's head office in Dar es Salaam. The sample size was calculated using Solvin's formula.

$$\text{Sample size} = N / (1 + N * e^2)$$

Where: confidence interval - 95%

E-5%

n= sample size to be studied

N= population size

e= margin of error

From $n = N / (1 + N * e^2)$, $n = 83$ respondents.

Structured questionnaires (closed-ended questionnaires) were used as an instrument for data collection because the study had a large population; it is easier and quicker for respondents to answer as concurred by Ragab and Arisha (2018). The respondents were required to respond by ticking the most appropriate option as per the Likert scale where 5 = Strongly Disagree, 4 = Disagree, 3 = Neutral, 2 = Agree, and 1 = Strongly Agree respectively and the results of the analysis were shown in Table.

The researcher asked help from one of the employees, a friend, in distributing the questionnaire and the employees were given time to fill out the questionnaires which was 2 days. The questionnaires were later collected for analysis. Therefore, through structured questionnaires, the researcher got a response rate of 100%. Data were analysed using descriptive statistics with the aid of software (SPSS version 20) whereby frequency and percentage were used to analyse the demographic characteristics of respondents and responses to the statements of the study such as; the main effects of 360-degree performance appraisal in Tigo Head Office, Dar es Salaam.

Results and Discussion

The demographic characteristics results below as seen in Table 1 consist of the age, gender, working experience and education of the respondents.

Table 1: Demographic characteristics of the respondents

Demographic characteristic		Frequency	Percent
Gender	Male	31	37.3
	Female	52	62.7
Age	20-30	37	44.6
	31-40	14	16.9
	41-50	29	34.9
	51 and above	3	3.6
Work experience	below 1 year	17	20.5
	2-5 years	32	38.6
	6-10 years	30	36.1
	Above 10 years	4	4.8
Education level	Secondary	15	18.1
	College	27	32.5
	University	41	49.4
Total		83	100

Around 37.3% of the respondents were male while females were 62.7%. The higher participation rate of females could be the nature of activities at the Tigo Head Office. Most service duties were performed by females. Likewise, respondents had different age groups, 44.6% consisted age group 20 -30 years, and 16.9%. age group 31-40 years while the age group 41-50 years comprised 34.9% of the respondents and the age group above 51 comprised of 3.6%. Cumulatively the younger age group of 20-30 and 31-40 constituted the majority accounting for 61.4% of all the respondents. The nature of the work at Tigo, for example, network, customer services, calls and responses to customers, necessitated Tigo to recruit young graduates who could easily cope with ICT-related activities.

In the education status section, 18.1% had secondary education, 32.5% had a college education and 49.4 % had a university education level. The majority of respondents had a University education qualification. This is because telecommunication companies like Tigo required employees who had adequate education levels to deal with various technical issues. This also indicated that the company is equipped with skilled and qualified individuals. This also showed that respondents had enough knowledge and understanding of the variables in the questionnaire and hence reliable information was given.

Of the respondents who filled the questionnaires, the majority had work experience of between 6 and 10 years followed by those who had a working experience between 2 to 5 years. This implied that the company has workers with enough years of experience which could lead to organization creativity, innovation and competitive advantage. Also, findings revealed that those who had sufficient work experience constituted 74.7% of all the respondents. This was an indication that the company had a team with a wealth of experience.

In the likert analysis, respondents were asked to give their views on whether performance improvement was among the main effects of 360-degree performance appraisal. The findings as presented in Table 2 indicated that respondents had different views on whether the main use of 360-degree performance appraisal was for performance improvement. Specifically, the findings showed that among those who filled out the questionnaires, the majority (57.8%) strongly agreed that the main purpose of using 360-degree performance appraisal was for performance improvement.

The findings revealed that there were performance improvement elements such as regular follow-up, close monitoring of employee performance, rewards and clear definition of objectives and tasks accruing from a 360-degree performance appraisal system. This was the reason why Tigo preferred to use this type of appraisal system. The findings of the current study and evidence from other researchers such as Leive (2019) and Armstrong (2009) concur that the identification of employees' performance was one of the main uses of 360-degree performance appraisal. A performance appraisal system was used in evaluating the level of performance of employees at the workplace.

Identifying Employees' strengths and weaknesses: respondents were asked to give their views on whether the effect of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify employees' strengths and weaknesses and by addressing them improve employees' performance generally and the organization's performance in particular. Their views were presented in Table 2 which showed that all respondents (83) participated in answering this particular question. According to Table 1, 4 (4.8%) of respondents, disagreed that the main purpose of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify employees' strengths and weaknesses, 3 (3.6%) of respondents were neutral, 27 (32.5%) of respondents, agreed and 49 (59%) of respondents, strongly agreed. Generally, the majority of respondents strongly agreed that the main use of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify employees' strengths and weaknesses to improve employees' performance. The findings revealed that the 360-degree performance appraisal used in Tigo Company had been of great help and acted as a useful tool for identifying employees' weaknesses, which was used to identify areas that needed improvement.

The findings aligned with those of Ashwini and Preethab (2017) who studied the contribution of 360-degree feedback on employees' engagement in India. It was indicated that 360-degree feedback performance appraisal was a tool that was used to see if there were weak areas in the performance of employees to help them. The study also indicated that feedback motivated employees at the workplace and gave them personal satisfaction. Apart from monitoring and evaluating employees and their supervisors' performance, 360-degree feedback was also used in making decisions about pay, promotion and other incentives. The findings from the study and those from Panda and Das (2014) and Ashwini and Preethab (2017) confirmed that the 360-degree performance appraisal helped employees to be aware of their weaknesses and strengths and knowing their weaknesses helped in identifying training needs that would strengthen them.

Table 2: Percentage distribution obtained in the likert scale analysis

Variables	Strongly agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
360-degree performance appraisal identified performance improvement	57.8	36.1	3.6	0	2.4
360-degree performance appraisal identified employees' strengths and weaknesses	59	32.5	3.6	4.8	0
360-degree performance appraisal identified training needs	63.9	26.5	6	0	2.4
360-degree performance appraisal assessed employees' working morale level	54.2	26.5	8.4	6	4.8
To understand employees' working commitment	50.6	30.1	8.4	6	4.8
360-degree performance appraisal is to identify external stakeholders' needs	55.4	33.7	1.2	6	3.6

On identifying training needs: The respondents were asked to give their views on whether the main use of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify training needs, to improve employee performance. The study showed that 2 respondents, 2.4% strongly disagreed with the statement, 5 (6%) respondents, were neutral, 22 (26.5%) respondents, agreed and 53 (63.9%) respondents strongly agreed. Generally, the majority were those who agreed and strongly agreed that the main use of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify training needs. This means that 360-degree performance appraisal is aimed at identifying areas of weakness among employees so that training can be planned by the organization to fix up those areas with weakness thus improving their performance.

The findings presented in Table 2 concur with those from Ashwini and Preethab (2017) and Mazhisham et al. (2018) who studied the contribution of 360-degree feedback on employees' engagement in India. The authors indicated that 360-degree feedback performance appraisal is a tool that is used to see if there are weak areas in the performance of employees to help them. After weaknesses are identified then training needs may be highlighted.

The findings of this study and evidence from Ashwini and Preethab (2017) had a positive response towards 360-degree performance appraisal in terms of training needs. Both studies concluded that the identification of training needs was one of the main purposes of 360-degree performance appraisal in any organization. This helped the organization tackle employees' weaknesses at the workplace.

Employees' working morale: respondents were asked to give their views on whether the main effect of the 360-degree performance appraisal system was to understand employees' working morale. In this attribute, the researcher wanted to know whether the main effect of 360-degree performance appraisal was to assess the employees' working morale level for improved performance of the organization. According to the respondents' views, it was found that 4 (4.8%) respondents, strongly disagreed with the statement, 5 (6%) respondents disagreed, 7 (8.4%) respondents were neutral, 22 (26.5%) respondents agreed and 45 respondents strongly agreed. This means the majority of

respondents 67 (80.7 %,) agreed that the main purpose of the 360-degree performance appraisal was to understand the employees working morale level.

The findings of this study correlated with those of Rudman (2020) who indicated that there is a need for the human resource personnel system to use an appraisal system which is more effective with no inaccuracies and that is truly valid for rating employees. The study by Rudman (2020) further noted that feedback from fair and unbiased 360-degree performance appraisal could boost the employees' working morale level.

Therefore, findings from this study and that of Rudman (2020) suggested that understanding employees' working morale is one of the main uses of a 360-degree performance appraisal system within an organization. Therefore, whenever performance appraisal is done in the company, feedback is always an important tool which boosts employees' performance.

Employees' working commitment: Respondents were asked to give their views on whether the main effects of 360-degree performance appraisal were to understand employees' working commitment, to improve employees' performance. It was indicated in Table 2 that 4 (4.8%) respondents, strongly disagreed that the main purpose of 360-degree performance appraisal was to understand employees' working commitment, 5 respondents, equivalent to 6% disagreed, 7 (8.4%) respondents, were neutral, 25 (30.1%) respondents, agreed and 42(50.6%) respondents, strongly agreed. Therefore, the majority of respondents (88.7%) strongly agreed that the main purpose of 360-degree performance appraisal was to understand employees working commitment. This implied that the feedback from the 360-degree performance appraisal is useful in improving the working commitment of employees.

The findings were in agreement with those of Green et al. (2019) in their study on Crowd-sourced employer reviews and stock returns which found that it was important to set performance standards and make employees aware of those standards which would be used in comparing with employee's performance when measuring performance. This study also revealed that for an organization to benefit from employee performance after the appraisal was done, necessary actions like rewards, training, promotion, salary increase and career development should be taken. Providing all the necessary actions after evaluation of employees' performance leads employees to be of greater advantage to the organization like increasing productivity and winning competitive advantage.

Conclusively, the findings from this study and evidence from the findings of other researchers agree that one of the main uses of 360-degree performance appraisal is understanding employees' work commitment. Also, concerning expectancy theory, employees' working commitment improves due to the rewards they receive after they have performed as they were expected.

Identify external stakeholders' needs: Furthermore, respondents were asked to give their views on whether one of the main effects of 360-degree performance appraisal was to identify external stakeholders' needs so that when they are addressed improved organization's performance may follow. The findings reflected in Table 1 revealed those 3(3.6%) respondents strongly disagreed, 5 (6%) respondents, disagreed, and 1 (1.2%) respondent, was neutral. On a positive note, 28 (33.7%) respondents, and 46 (55.4%) respondents, stood for agreed and strongly agreed respectively. Generally, the results indicated that responses for positive stance accounted for 74 (89.3%) responses. The findings gave an implication that external stakeholders were also very important assets in any company and involving them in performance appraisal is inevitable. With 360-degree performance

appraisal, external stakeholders' needs such as the labour laws, governing board and regulatory authorities are important aspects when planning for 360-degree performance appraisal. A study conducted by Athota and Malik (2018) on 360-degree feedback at the workplace, showed that 360-degree performance appraisal was a tool used to develop employees and organization capabilities. For an organization to develop its capabilities and those of its employees it should focus more on understanding the advantage of involving stakeholders in performance review such as customers and shareholders.

Findings from the study and evidence adduced by other findings highlighted that identification of external stakeholders' needs helped the organization in getting feedback from customers or shareholders which allowed employees and the organization to improve and develop their skills and capabilities.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The results of this study suggested that 360-degree performance appraisal in Tigo Head Office in Dar es Salaam has some of its main effects on employees' performance such as improving employee's performance, identifying employees' strengths and weaknesses related to their performance at the workplace, and identifying training needs among employees at the company. Lastly, Tigo Head Office also needed 360-degree performance appraisal to foster employees' working morale, boosting employees working commitment and also acting as a tool to meet the external stakeholders' needs. Tigo kept on using the 360-degree performance appraisal because it made it easier for them to monitor the level of performance of their employees. Whereas with Tigo's improvement in employee performance through 360-degree Performance appraisal, it could be a lesson to other telecommunication organizations. Lastly, the study further recommended that both human and material resources should be set aside for the effective implementation of the 360-degree performance appraisal.

References

- Ajibola, K.S., Mukulu, E. & Orwa, G.O. (2019). Performance appraisal as determinant of employee work engagement: Evidence from Nigeria manufacturing firms. *International Journal of Human Resources and Procurement*, 8(2): 45–58.
- Ali, Z., Mahmood, B. & Mehreen, A. (2019). Linking succession planning to employee performance: The mediating roles of career development and performance appraisal, *Australian Journal of Career Development*, 28(2), 112-121.
- Armstrong, M. & Taylor, S. (2009). *Armstrong's Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice* 11th Edition. London: Kogan Page Publishers.
- Ashwini, A. & Preethab, S. (2017). Influence of 360-degree appraisal's affirmative feedback on employee engagement. *International Journal of Economic Research*, www.serialsjournal.com/volume11.
- Athota, V. & Malik, A. (2018). 360-Degree Feedback at the workplace: A transformative learning perspective. In: A. Lipnevich & J. Smith (Eds). *The Cambridge Handbook of Instructional Feedback* (Cambridge Handbooks in Psychology, pp.313-332).

Cambridge University Press. doi:10.1017/9781316832134.016.

- Cudjoe, S. (2021). Assessing the effectiveness of the performance appraisal system of the University of Cape Coast. PhD Thesis, University of Cape Coast, Ghana.
- Dangol, P. (2021). Role of performance appraisal system and its impact on employees motivation. *Quantitative Economics and Management Studies*, 2(1): 13-26.
- Green, T. C., Huang, R., Wen, Q., & Zhou, D. (2019). Crowd-sourced employer reviews and stock returns. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 134(1): 236-251.
- Gupta, C.B. (2006). Human Resource Management, 7th Edition, New Delhi: Sultan Chand and sons, Educational Publishers.
- Iyiola, A. ., Olatoye, O.A. & Oyekanmi, T.T. (2020). Impact of performance appraisal strategy on employee productivity: Evidence from selected Nigerian banks. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 9(1): 770-783.
- Kottathai, S. & Abinaya, K. (2021). A Study of 360-degree Performance Appraisal in Egs Computers India Private Limited Chennai, *International Journal of Advance Research and Innovative Ideas in Education*, 7(4), 138-142.
- Leive, M.M. (2022). 360-degree performance appraisal system with the focus on employee learning and development: A comparison of feedback systems used in organizations and education. Unpublished Masters Thesis of University of Twente, The Netherlands.
- Mazhidism, P.H., Khalid, M.Y., Nazli, N.N.N.N., Manap, R., Hussain., N.H.M. Identification of Training Need Assessment in Organizational Content. *International Journal of Modern Trends in Social Science*, 1 (5), 20-30.
- Mukhopadhyay, K. (2016). "360 – Degree Appraisal" – A Performance Assessment Tool. Available online: 360 –Degree Appraisal Performance Assessment. <http://www.ukessays/businessrelationship> (accessed on 8th January, 2024).
- Nchimbi, A. (2019). Implementation of open performance review and appraisal system in Tanzania local government authorities: some observations and remarks. *International Journal of African and Asian Studies*, 53, 32-40.
- Ndungu, D. N. (2017). The Effects of Rewards and Recognition on Employee Performance in Public Educational Institutions: A Case of Kenyatta University, Kenya. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research*, 17, <http://www.srip.org/referencespapers?referenceid=3172664> (accessed on 9th May, 2024).
- Nugraha, H., Kencanasari, R., Nuril, R.(2020). Employability skills in technical vocational education and training, *The Innovation of Vocational Technology Education*, 16(1): 1- 10.
- Panda, T.K. & Das, S. (2014). The Role of Tangibility in Service Quality and its Impact on

External Customer Satisfaction: A Comparative Study of Hospital and Hospitality Sectors accessed at <http://www.researchgate.net/publication/350312888> (accessed on 25th April, 2024).

Peng, A.C., & Zeng, W. (2017). Workplace Ostracism and Deviant and Helping Behaviours; The Moderating Role of 360 Degree Feedback. *Journal of Organizational Behaviour*, 38(6): 833-855. Doi:10.1002/job. 2169.

Prasetyaningrum, D. & Setiawan, Y. A. (2020). Analysis of performance appraisal system with 360-degree feedback method in Pt. Pertamina Ru Iv (Persero) Cilacap.05(02), 105–114. <https://doi.org/10.33062/mjb.v5i2.399>.

Ragab, M.A., & Arisha, A. (2018). Research methodology in business: A starter's guide. *Management and Organizational Studies*, 5(1), 1-14.

Rudman, R. (2020). Performance planning and review: Making employee appraisals work. London: Routledge.

Setiawati, T. & Ariani, I. D. (2020). Influence of performance appraisal fairness and job satisfaction through commitment on job performance. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 9(3): 133-151.

Society for Human Resource Management - SHRM. (2023). 360-Degree Feedback. <https://www.shrm.org/topics-tools/news/hr-magazine/performance-management-hr-mag>.

Vroom, V. (1964). Expectancy Theory: How to Apply the Theory in [Vrooms-Expectancy-of-Needs-theory.pdf \(potentialunearthed.co.uk\)](#) (accessed on 7th May, 2024).

Wang, M., Zhu, C.J.; Mayson, S. & Chen, W. (2019). Contextualizing performance appraisal practices in Chinese public sector organizations: The importance of context and areas for future study. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 30(5): 902-919.

Zondo, R.D. (2018). The Influence of a 360 Degree Performance Appraisal on Productivity in an automotive manufacturing organization. *South African Journal of Economics and Management Sciences*, [The influence of a 360-degree performance appraisal on labor productivity in an automotive manufacturing organization \(researchgate.net\)](#) (accessed on 10th May, 2024).

GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

Manuscripts intended for publication with TUDARCo Journal of Humanities and Education should be submitted electronically in 'word' format, double spaced, And with wide margins. Manuscript should range between 5,000 and 8,000 words (including references and appendices). The manuscript should typically be in the following order:

Abstract: The abstract should not exceed 250 words in length.

Keywords: A maximum of five most important terms that describe your research domain and specific problem area investigated.

Introduction: It should be informing the reader of the relevance of your research.

Review of Literature: This section includes a short history or relevant background of the research area being addressed.

Methods: This section should provide details on how the research was conducted.

Findings and Discussion: This section describes the outputs generated in the methods section.

Conclusion: Final extract of the research performed.

=====

Notes should be numbered consecutively and placed at the bottom of the page (footnotes). In-text citation should follow 'author-date' system.

For books: surname, initials, (year). Title of book, publisher, place of publication e.g. Fulbright, A. and Khan, G. (2001). *Competing Strategies*, Outhouse Press: Rochester.

For book chapters: surname, initials, (year). Chapter title, editor's surname, initials, title of book, publisher, place of publication, pages, e.g. Bessley, M. and Wilson, P. (1999). Marketing for the production manager, In: Levicki, J. (Ed.), *Taking the Blinkers off Managers*, Broom Relm: London, pp.29-33.

For journals: surname, initials, (year). Title of article, journal name, volume, number, pages, e.g. Kibet, M. (2013). Migration into Rustenburg local municipality Between 1996 and 2001. *Journal of Social Development in Africa*, 28(1): 65-85.

Conference proceedings: Treat conference proceedings in the same way that you would do to a journal article, but inset the full conference title and dates where the journal title would normally appear.

For websites: surname, initials (year); title of cited work, available at: website link (accessed on appropriate date), e.g. Smith, R. (2004). Managerial roles and coping responses, available at <http://www.managerial.roles.coping.responses> (accessed 29th June 2016).



Coca Cola Road, Mikocheni Light Industrial Area
Telephone: +255 222 702 025 / 222 702 026
Website: www.tudarco.ac.tz
P.O. Box 77588, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania